

**LAGUNA LAKE DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY (LLDA)
2017 Performance Scorecard Evaluation**

Component		Rating Scale			Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
		Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
ENVIRONMENTAL / SOCIAL IMPACT	SO 1	Manage and Improve Water Quality (Class C)										
	SM 1	Development of priority policies required by the Master Plan	N/A	5%	All or nothing	Board approved Zoning and Management Plan (ZOMAP) for Fisheries	Board Resolution No. 540, s. 2018 "Zoning and Management Guidelines (ZOMAG)"	None stated	Board Resolution No. 540, s. 2018 "Zoning and Management Guidelines (ZOMAG)"	0.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Certificate from Board Secretary certifying lack of quorum on Nov-Dec 2017 Resolution by the Panel of Experts on the carrying capacity of Lake Board Resolution No. 540, s. 2018 "Zoning and Management Guidelines (ZOMAG)" 	Request for reconsideration is <u>DENIED</u> . Target not met. While ZOMAG provides for guidelines, it is insufficient to fully comply with the parameters of the measure.
	SM 2	Maintain water quality of Laguna de Bay	Average of monthly values (in milligrams per liter (mg/L) Biochemical Oxygen Demand (BOD)) ¹	5%	All or nothing	Within the standard BOD ²	Annual average value of 3 mg/L	None stated	Within the standard BOD (annual average of 3.15 mg/L)	5.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Monthly Results of Laboratory Analysis (ROLA) 	Target met. There is slight difference in the reported actual of LLDA due to rounding of figures.

¹ BOD is a measure of the approximate quantity of dissolved oxygen that will be required by bacteria to stabilize organic matter in wastewater or surface water (DENR Administrative Order (AO) No. 35 (1991)). LLDA covers nine (9) sampling stations.

² DENR Administrative Order No. 2016-08 (Water Quality Guidelines and General Effluent Standards) provides that 7 mg/L is the required minimum water quality for BOD applicable to water bodies categorized as Class C (fishery water for the propagation and growth of fish and other aquatic resources, and for boating, fishing, or similar activities).

Request for Reconsideration on the Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (**Annex A**)

Component		Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks		
Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating				
SM 3	Percentage of industries disposing wastewater within standard (50 mg/L) ³	Total number of industries disposing wastewater within standard / Total number of industries ⁴	5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	85%	96.99% or 644 of 664 industries disposing wastewater are within the standard of 50 mg/L for BOD	None stated	96.43% (324/336)	5.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> List of Industries Disposing Wastewater Within Standards 	Target met. The computation based on the actual inspection results during 2017 was used.
SO 2 Improve Lake Productivity											
SM 4	Lake area covered by aquaculture structures (net at the end of the year)	Net area at the end of the year (in hectares (has.))	10%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> If less than 9,200 has. = 10.00% If between 9,200 has. and 11,000 has. = (Actual / Target) x Weight If above 11,000 has. = 0.00% 	9,200 has.	9,044.69 has. of aquastructures existing as of end of 2017	None stated	9,044.69 has.	10.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Masterlist of aquastructure in Laguna Lake Map of Aqua-structures in Laguna Lake signed by Environmental Regulations Dept. Manager After-activity reports Sampled cases 	LLDA exceeded the target. There was a reduction of aquaculture structures from 12,476.51 hectares in 2016 into 9,044.65 hectares in 2017.
Sub-total		25.0%					23.50%		20.00%		

³ Under DENR Administrative Order (AO) No. 35, 50 mg/L is the standard BOD for New/Proposed Industry (NPI) or wastewater treatment plants to be constructed under Class C inland water category (Table 2A)

⁴ Total number of industries by end of the previous year.

Request for Reconsideration on the Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (**Annex A**)

Component		Rating Scale		Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks		
Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.		2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating				
SO 3 Ensure Environmental / Regulatory Compliance												
STAKEHOLDERS	SM 5	Percentage of compliance of new establishments to permitting requirements	Total number of applications received with ECC or CNC clearance in the present year / Total number of NOV's issued in the preceding year	10%	Above 35% = 10.00% 31% to 35% = 7.00% 22% to 30% = 5.00% Below 22% = 0.00%	35%	77 applications with ECC/CNC received out of 373 NOV's issued in 2016 (20.64%)	None stated	11.50% (56/487)	0.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> List of NOV cases issued and resolved Sampled cases 	<p>Target not met. The validated score was based on the formula of the measure.</p> <p>LLDA failed to follow the formula when it excluded the applications from the preceding year as well as the NOV's personally delivered. It also excluded exempted those exempted from securing the LLDA Clearance (LC) and/or Discharge Permit (DP).</p>
	SM 6	Percentage of compliance of existing permits renewed	Total number of permits renewed / Total number of establishments due for renewal	5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight 53% and lower = 0%	93%	86.74% of permits due for renewal were renewed in 2017 (2,277 out of 2,625 permits)	None stated	86.74% (2,277/2,625)	4.67%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> List of DP cases Sampled cases 	Reported accomplishment is acceptable.
	SO 4 Improve Stakeholder Satisfaction											
SM 7	Percentage of stakeholders which rated LLDA as satisfactory	Total number of respondents which rated LLDA as satisfactory (at least a rating of 4 using a 5-	5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	75% of respondents gave LLDA at least satisfactory rating	Perception Survey was accepted by the LLDA Management Committee on July 12, 2017 with an overall satisfactory rating of 62%	None stated	61.75% of respondents gave LLDA at least satisfactory rating	4.12%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Transmittal Letter from People Dynamics, Inc to LLDA Terminal Report on Customer Satisfaction Survey 2017 for LLDA by 	LLDA was able to conduct for the first time the stakeholder satisfaction survey.	

Request for Reconsideration on the Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (**Annex A**)

Component		Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks		
Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating				
	point rating scale) / Total number of respondents							People Dynamics, Inc.			
Sub-total		20.0%			9.66%		8.79%				
FINANCIAL											
SO 5	Increase Revenues										
SM 8	Revenue generated	Amount Absolute	10%	Above ₱255.221 Million = 10% ₱241 Million to ₱255 Million = 8% ₱220 Million to ₱240 Million = 5% Below ₱220 Million = 0%	₱255.221 Million	₱299.411 Million as per 2017 Audited Financial Statement	None stated	₱294.243 Million	10.00%	• 2017 COA Audited Financial Statements	LLDA exceeded the target.
Sub-total		10.0%					10.00%		10.00%		
INTERNAL PROCESS											
SO 6	Improve Efficiency in Quasi-Judicial Functions										
SM 9	Percentage of cases resolved through Alternative Dispute Resolutions (ADRs)	Total number of cases resolved / Total number of cases subject to ADR	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight 60% and below = 0%	70%	70.63% cases resolved with Technical Conference conducted or issued with Certificated of Compliance (844 out of 1,195 cases)	None stated	70.63% (844/1,195)	10.00%	• List of cases endorsed to ADR and resolved cases • Sampled cases	LLDA exceeded the target.
SM 10	Percentage of cases resolved (issued with Order to Pay,	Total number of cases resolved	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	30% of cases resolved within applicable	Operating without LC: 223 out of 1,512 cases (15%) resolved within 120 wd	None stated	15.74% (634/4,027)	5.25%	• List of cases endorsed to PHC and resolved cases	Request for reconsideration is ACCEPTED .

Request for Reconsideration on the Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (**Annex A**)

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.		2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
	CDO, Order of Dismissal) within applicable processing time ⁵	within applicable processing time / Total number of cases (including unresolved cases in 2012 to cutoff date of June 30 of every year)		processing time	Operating without DP: 192 out of 1,445 cases (13%) resolved within 170 wd	None stated			• Sampled cases		
					Water pollution: 189 out of 887 cases (21%) resolved within 120 wd	None stated					
					Refusal of Entry: 30 out of 183 (16%) cases resolved within 95 wd	None stated					
SM 11	Percentage of new and renewal applications for permits and licenses processed within applicable processing time ⁶	Total number of permits and licenses issued with applicable processing time / Total number of applications	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	70%	61.52% of applications issued within applicable processing time	None stated	61.52% (2,638/4,288)	8.79%	• List of applications received and processed	Reported accomplishment is acceptable.
Sub-total		30.0%				24.27%		24.04%			

⁵ Applicable processing time: operating without LLDA Clearance – 120 working days (wd), operating without Discharge Permit – 170 wd, water pollution – 120 wd, refusal of entry – 95 wd, violation of ZOMAP – 60 wd.

⁶ Applicable processing time for permits and licenses – 30 wd.

Request for Reconsideration on the Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (**Annex A**)

	Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
	Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.		2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
LEARNING AND GROWTH	SO 6	Improve Efficiency in Quasi-Judicial Functions										
	SM 12	Percentage of personnel meeting required competencies	N/A	5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	Competency Integration and Updating of HR Systems (recruitment and L&D)	Competency-Based Qualification Standards (CBQS) submitted to CSC for approval on May 19, 2017	None stated	Competency Integration and Updating of HR Systems (recruitment and L&D)	5.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Competency Based Human Resource (HR) Management System Competency-Based Qualifications Standards of each position LLDA's letter to CSC dated 19 May 2017 transmitting the HR Management System 	Acceptable.
	SO 9	Automate Processes										
SM 13	Processes automated	N/A	5%	All or nothing	Automation of LLDA Clearance and Discharge Permit issuances	1. Publication/Posting to PhilGEPS: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Publication of Request for Expression of Interest (REOI) on October 25, 2017 Issuance of letter for the Opening Eligibility Documents on November 10, 2017 Opening of Eligibility Documents wherein three (3) consulting firms were declared 	None stated	None	0.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Terms of Reference on software development for the LLDA Automated Permit Processing System (LAPPS) Publication in the Philippine Star of the Request for Expression of Interest (27 October 2017 issue) Copy of Cancelled BAC Resolution on shortlisting of bidders dated 07 May 2018 	Target not met. Procurement for the consultancy of LAPPS was cancelled by the management. The request of LLDA to revise the rating scale to milestone-based is not approved and LLDA is given no point considering that the automation was not even started in 2017.	

Request for Reconsideration on the Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (**Annex A**)

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.		2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
					eligible on November 20, 2017 2. Implementation of Automation Process (Cancelled due to change in management direction)						
SO 10	Develop and Implement Quality Management System (QMS)										
SM 14	ISO Certification	N/A	5%	ISO 9001:2015 = 5.00% Maintain ISO 9001:2008 = 2.50%	ISO 9001:2015 Certification	AJA Registrars Inc. completed its 2 nd Surveillance Audit on 13 October 2017. The Lead Auditor of the said certification body recommended the "continued certification follow off site verification of responses"; Submission of bids for engagement of Certification Body to audit LLDA's QMS based on ISO 9001:2015 standards was conducted on 24 October 2017; Evaluation of technical proposal was completed on 09 November 2017.	None stated	Renewal of ISO 9001:2008 Certification	2.50%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Minutes of the Quality Management System Review dated 04 September 2017 Attestation Certificate from AJA Registrars, Inc. dated 15 December 2017 	LLDA passed the surveillance audit of the AJA Registrars, Inc in 2017. Meanwhile, it is already preparing for application to ISO 9001:2015 Certification.
Sub-total		15.0%					10.50%		7.50%		
TOTAL		100.0%					77.93%		70.33%		