PARTIDO DEVELOPMENT ADMINISTRATION (PDA) Performance Scorecard Evaluation

	Component			Rating	Target	PDA		GCG Valid	ation	Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
0	bjective	/ Measure		Weight	Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
SOCIAL IMPACT/STAKEHOLDERS	1	Development and Implementation of a Water System Expansion Plan	ice Coverage	7.0%	All or nothing	Mapping of households for PWSS expansion	Gathered data for Garchito-rena, Caramoan, Presenta-cion, Siruma, and Tinambac (coastal areas) Processed the data using the Geographic Information System	7.00%	Insufficient Supporting Document	0.00%	• Final Report for GPS Project- Phase 1 for the Period 31 December 2017	PDA submitted a copy of the Final Report for GPS Project-Phase 1 for the Period 31 December 2017. The 1-page document provides the total number of the following: (1) active connections, (2) disconnected households, and (3) without connection per municipality. Another column labeled "Number of Vacant" was presented, but it is not clear what it pertains to. However, the source documents were not submitted by PDA which renders the reported data unverifiable. With this, no rating was given for this accomplishment.
SOCIAL II	1	Service Expansion of PWSS	Total No. of New Household (HH) connections per category: 1. From existing covered barangays	3.0% 5.0%	(Actual/ Target) x Weight	1. New connection from existing Barangays – 1,686 2. Reconnections – 594 3. New connections from expansion	1. New connection from existing Barangays – 1,387 2. Reconnections – 392 3. New connections from expansion barangays – 141	2.47% 3.30% 3.92%	Insufficient Supporting Document	0.00%	 Summary of Total Number of Households per Category 	No score was given for the reported accomplishment since it cannot be validated objectively. This is due to the absence of any verifiable document that would support the details stated in the summary provided by PDA.

P D A | Page 2 of 9

Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

		Compon	ent		Rating Scale	Target	PDA		GCG Valid	ation	Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Ol	jective	/ Measure	Formula	Weight	Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
			2. Reconnections 3. From expansion barangays	5.0%		barangays – 180 (Total –1,460)	(Total – 1,920)					
4	SO 2	Enhanced Ac	cess to Qualit	y Social	Services							
**************************************	SM 3	Maintain the Quality of Drinking Water	Based on the result of Third Party test	5.0%	All or Nothing	100% of tests conducted negative of bacteria	100%	5.00%	100% of tests conducted negative of bacteria	5.00%	 Results of Bacteriolo- gical Potability Testing issued by MNWD 	Acceptable. Certifications of potability issued by Metropolitan Naga Water District (MNWD) showed that all water samples submitted by PDA "Passed" the tests conducted by MNWD.
ē	SO 3	Enhanced LG	U and Partne	rs' Capab	oility							
	SM 4	Number of Trainees in Education, Fisheries, and Coastal Resources, Health, and Investment	Actual number of participants for the year	5.0%	(Actual/ Target) x Weight	2,500 participants	2,554	5.00%	2,497	4.99%	Activity reports on trainings conducted and attendance sheets	PDA reported that there were 2,554 participants for trainings conducted in 2017. However, validation of training reports and attendance sheets showed that the total number of participants was only 2,497. The variance between the PDA-reported accomplishment and the GCG-validated number pertains to the 57 attendees during the second day of the Training on Community-Led Total Sanitation. It was excluded to avoid double counting since the said training was a 2-day activity with the same attendees for the 1st and 2nd day.

P D A | Page 3 of 9

Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

		Compon	ient	Tarihi Ta	Rating	Target	PDA		GCG Valid	ation	Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
0	bjective	e / Measure	Formula	Weight	Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
	SO 4	Improved Clie	ent Satisfactio	n								·
	SM 5	Agency level satisfaction survey	Number of stakeholders who gave a rating of Very High and High (upper two boxes in a scale of 1- 4) / Total number of stakeholders surveyed	5.0%	(Actual/ Target) x Weight	90% of stakeholders who gave a rating of Very High and High (upper two boxes in a scale of 1-4)	98%	5.00%	Insufficient Supporting Document	0.00%	Customer Satisfaction Survey Result	PDA's reported accomplishment cannot be objectively verified as the complete survey report was not submitted. The necessary information to determine the total number of stakeholders surveyed and the corresponding number of those who rated "Very High" and "High" were not presented in the supporting document provided by PDA. Further, the GCG cannot rely on the data presented in the submission without the detailed report on survey methodology and analysis of the survey results. In this regard, no score was given for the reported accomplishment.
			Sub-total	35.0%			upa 197 ga tao a tao 1971 J. P.	31.69%		9.99%	e are a best core a R e e ter	2
	SO 5	Improved Ope	erational Effic	iency and	d Profitabili	ty						
FINANCIAL	SM 6	Collection Efficiency on Current Billing	Current Collection + Discounts + Taxes withheld / Total Current Billing	5.0%	(Actual/ Target) x Weight	92%	88.93%	4.83%	Insufficient Supporting Document	0.00%	 Report on PWSS Collection Efficiency for Current Billings Billing Summary for the Month of December 2017 	As reported by PDA, the collection efficiency rate was at 88.93% for 2017. It was determined that it pertains to the average of the monthly collection efficiency indicated in the summary submitted by PDA. However, further details on the monthly billings and collections were not available. These details cannot be derived and/or computed from the audited financial statements (FS). In particular, it was noted that the audited statement of cash flows

P D A | Page 4 of 9

Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

	Component			Rating	Target	PDA		GCG Valid	ation	Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Ob	ective	/ Measure	Formula	Weight	Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
												presented a condensed amount of total income collection which include collections not only for PWSS' current billings but also for prior years' billings and those from PDA's other segments, if any. In this regard, the accuracy of the reported accomplishment cannot be established.
	SM 7	Collection Efficiency on Accounts Receivable	Collection for prior years' receivables / active accounts + inactive accounts receivable	10.0%	(Actual/ Target) x Weight	35%	27.73%	7.92%	Insufficient Supporting Document	0.00%	Report on the Collection Efficiency for Accounts Receivable	The submitted supporting document showed a summary of the total collections per month, but without the supporting documents on the collections. Verification of the reported amounts from the 2016 COA Annual Audit Report showed that the total receivables as of end of 2016 amounted to \$\text{P31.84}\$ Million. On the other hand, the actual collections out of the said amount was not presented in the 2017 COA Annual Audit Report. As in the case of SM 6, the necessary information to further verify the amounts presented in its submission are not available. Thus, the reported accomplishment cannot be validated objectively.

P D A | Page 5 of 9

Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

		Compon	ent		Rating	Target	PDA		GCG Valid	ation	Supporting Documents	GCG Rem	narks
Ok	jective	/ Measure	Formula	Weight	Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
	SM 8	Settle the Issue with NWRB on Water Tariff Increase	NWRB Approval of PDA's tariff increase application	5.0%	All or Nothing	Approval of PDA's tariff increase application	Filed application for Certificate of Public Convenience (CPC) for the tariff increase application. Awaiting for NWRB's approval of PDA's tariff application.	5.00%	Approval of tariff application was not issued	0.00%	Application for CPC received by National Water Resources Board (NWRB)	The target was not	achieved.
	2				If the			,		2 8		The GCG-validate based on the form in the scorecard at the COA audited notes to FS, as def	nula indicated and the data in FS and the
e e			Earnings	w	EBITDA is:					at at at		Particulars	Amount in ₽ Millions
			before interest, tax,	u	≥ P 51 Million:				* '		COA Annual	Net Surplus	2.34
	SM 9	Increase EBITDA	depreciation	10.0%	Actual /	₱61 Million	P 54,270,665.73	8.90%	₱46.29 Million	0.00%	Audit Report on PDA for	Add Back:	
4		EBITUA	and amortization	27	Target x Weight				Willion		2017	Interest Expenses	16.20
			(EBITDA)		< ₱51						a 2 e a	Taxes	5.00
	a .		5		Million:	Ŧ .						Depreciation	22.75
					0.00%	,				e		Amortization	0.00
×		-			8		,			0		Sub-total	43.95
		*			8	शु त				9 -	e 2	EBITDA	46.29
						0				=			1 18 1 2 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1

P D A | Page 6 of 9

Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

	Component				Rating	Target PDA		GCG Valid	ation	Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
C	bjective	/ Measure	Formula	Weight	Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
	SM 10	Payment to the Bureau of Treasury for PDA's Foreign Loan and NG Advances	Actual amount remitted as reflected in Bureau of the Treasury Official Receipt(s)	15.0%	100% of payables due to BTr and The Royal Bank of Scotland (RBS) paid - 15% 80% of payables due to BTr and The RBS paid - 10% 50% of payables due to BTr and The RBS paid - 5% below 50% - 0%	100% of payables due to BTr and The Royal Bank of Scotland (RBS) paid ¹	Paid P 57.09 Million or full payment of payables due to BTr and the Royal Bank of Scotland (RBS)	15.00%	Insufficient Supporting Documents	0.00%	Bureau of Treasury (BTr) — National Government Debt Accounting Division Report on the status of advances to PDA as of 30 September 2018 COA Annual Audit Report on PDA for 2017	PDA only submitted one (1) receipt reflecting a payment to BTr amounting to \$\text{P}9.00\$ Million which is not consistent with the reported accomplishment of \$\text{P}57.09\$ Million. PDA also submitted copies of deposit slips and disbursement vouchers, but these were considered insufficient without the BTr Official Receipts. Note that the formula in the scorecard explicitly provides that the accomplishment shall be based on the amount reflected in the BTr Official Receipts. The GCG then referred to the BTr report on the status of advances to PDA and the audited statement of cash flows to verify the reported accomplishment. With this, it was confirmed that PDA's payment amounted to \$\text{P}57.09\$ Million for 2017. However, the GCG cannot verify based on submitted documents if the total payment covers 100% of the payables due to BTr for NG advances and 100% of the loan amortization due to RBS. Required documents to validate such are billing statements issued by the said entities. In

¹ Based on the billing statement from the BTr for NG Advances and The Royal Bank of Scotland for loan amortizations due 01 March and 01 September 2017.

P D A | Page 7 of 9

Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

	Component				Rating	Target	PDA		GCG Valida	ation	Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
C	bjective	/ Measure	Formula	Weight	Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
												this regard, a 0% rating was given to this measure.
	SM 11	Submission of a Repayment Plan	DOF- approved Repayment Plan for NG Advances	5.0%	All or Nothing	DOF- Approved Repayment Plan for NG Advances	Submitted the PDA's Proposed 26- Year repayment plan to DOF. DOF forwarded the document to the Office of the President and is awaiting the position that will be taken by the OP.	5.00%	Measure and weight removed from the scorecard	<u>-</u>	 Department of Finance (DOF) letter to PDA dated 09 November 2017 PDA letter to DOF submitting its Proposed Repayment Plan dated 02 October 2017 PDA Board Resolution No. 18 approving the Repayment Plan 	PDA, in its letter to DOF dated 02 October 2017, submitted its proposed 26-year repayment plan. However, in its reply to PDA per letter dated 09 November 2017, DOF informed PDA that its proposed dispositive action plan on PDA was submitted to the Office of the President (OP) and that the settlement of the NG advances would largely depend on the OP's position on the matter. Considering that the approval of the repayment plan is contingent on the decision of the OP, the approval of the repayment plan is completely beyond the control of PDA. With this, the GCG resolved to remove the measure and subtract its corresponding weight from the total weight of the performance scorecard.
	SM 12	% Non- Revenue Water (NRW)	(CuM Produced - CuM Billed) / Water Produced x 100	5.0%	NRW – Rating 5% to 22% 4% to 24%	20% (maximum acceptable Non- Revenue Water per LWUA)	24.10% as of November	4.00%	24.12%	4.00%	 PWSS Monthly Production as of December 2017 COA Annual Audit Report 	GCG's recomputation of the actual NRW was based on the data on water produced and billed per month, which revealed that the total water production for the 2017 was 5,120,730 cubic meters (cu. m.) and only 3,885,586 cu. m. were billed

P D A | Page 8 of 9

Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

		Compone	ent		Rating	Target	PDA		GCG Valid	ation	Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
0	biective	/ Measure	Formula	Weight	Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
					25% to 26% 27% to 28% 29% 1% Above 29%				Barrier State Control of the Control		on PDA for 2017	resulting in an NRW of 1,235,144 cu. m. or 24.12%. This was found consistent with the data presented in the audit observations per COA's 2017 Annual Report on PDA which showed an NRW level of 24.12% for 2017.
			Sub-total	55.0%				50.65%		4.00%		
	SQ 6	Established Q	uality Manag	ement Sy	ystem							
INTERNAL PROCESS	SM 13	ISO Certification	-	5.0%	All or Nothing	Readiness to ISO 9001:2015	IQA Training conducted	0.00%	Readiness Status was not achieved	0.00%	Internal Quality Audit (IQA) Report	Target not accomplished. Further, based on the IQA Report submitted, it appears that PDA was not yet transitioning to ISO 9001:2015 standards since the report stated that PDA was preparing for "ISO 9001-2008 Certification before the end of December 2017".
			Sub-total	5.0%				0.00%		0.00%		
	SO 7	Improved Co	mpetency of	the Orga	nization							
LEARNING AND	SM 14	Improve Competency of the Organization	-	5.0%	All or Nothing	Board- Approved	Board- Approved Competency Model	5.00%	Insufficient Supporting Document	0.00%	 PDA Board Resolution No. 28 dated 19 December 2017 PDA Letter to the Civil 	PDA reported that it was able to accomplish a Board-approved Competency Model in 2017. PDA submitted a copy of its Board Resolution No. 28, series of 2017 endorsing the PDA competency model; however, the Competency Model was not

P D A | Page 9 of 9

Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

	Component			Rating	Target	PDA		GCG Valid	lation	Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Ol	Objective / Measure Formula Weight		Weight	Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
						Competency Model ²					Service Commission (CSC) dated 26 February 2018	submitted. PDA also submitted a copy of its letter to the CSC dated 26 February 2018 transmitting its Competency Catalogue, among others, for the CSC's review and approval. However, the attached competency catalogue had incomplete pages. As such, the Competency Model was not noted even in the 2018 submission to CSC. In this regard, the CGO-A cannot validate whether the Competency Model contains the required components namely: Competency Catalogue, Competency Framework, and Competency Table. In this regard, no score was given for the reported accomplishment.
			Sub-total	5.0%			0 -	5.00%	·	0.00%		
	TOTAL 100.0%						87.34%		13.99% out of 95%			
	VALIDATED RATING				,				14.72%			

²Competency Model should include the Competency Catalogue, Competency Framework and Competency Table as defined in GCG issued FAQs on Competency Frameworks/Models