

**TOURISM INFRASTRUCTURE AND ENTERPRISE ZONE AUTHORITY (TIEZA)  
2017 Performance Scorecard Evaluation**

Objective / Measure	Component		Target		TIEZA Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
	Formula	Wt.	Rating Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
<b>SO 1</b>	<b>Contribute to Country's Competitiveness thru Development of Sustainable Tourism Zones and Support Infrastructure</b>										
SM 1	Development and Implementation of the Revised 5-Year Strategic Development Plan for TIEZA's Infrastructure Projects	Actual Accomplishment	10%	All or Nothing	Board-Approved Revised 5-Year Strategic Development Plan for Infrastructure Projects	Board-Approved Development Plan Approved by Board on 29 November 2017	10%	Board-Approved Revised Development Plan	10%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Draft revised 5-year Tourism Infrastructure Development Plan</li> <li>Secretary's Certificate</li> </ul>	While the Commission accepts the submission of the approved revised 5-Year Development Plan, we would like to emphasize that TIEZA needs to further develop a plan which includes a clear timeline of activities which shall serve as a guide in the overall conduct of business aside from the general framework of the plan.
<b>SO 2</b>	<b>Preserve Historical, Cultural, Religious and Heritage Sites and Develop Ecotourism Sites in Depressed Provinces with Strong Tourism Potential</b>										
SM 2	Conservation of World Heritage Sites based on NCCA MOA	Actual Accomplishment	10%	All or Nothing	Final Report for the Disaster Risk and Conservation Assessment for the following sites: 1. Church of La Inmaculada; 2. Church of San Agustin; 3. Church of La Asuncion de Nuestra Señora; 4. Church of Sto. Tomas de Villanueva; and, 5. Historic City of Vigan	90% of the activities required to complete the Final Report for the Disaster Risk and Conservation Assessment	9.05%	Final Report was not yet complete	0.0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project Accomplishment Report</li> <li>Inspection Report dated 09 February 2018</li> </ul>	Target not met. No final report submitted.

SOCIAL IMPACT

Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component			Target	TIEZA Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.	Rating Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
SM 3	Development of Ecotourism Sites in Depressed Provinces	No. of ecotourism sites developed as determined by NOA (based on the 2016 board-approved projects)	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	10 projects	9 ecotourism sites	9%	4 ecotourism sites/projects	4%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2016 Board-approved projects</li> <li>MOA/NOA of the projects of the 9 projects</li> </ul> <p>Of the nine (9) projects/sites, only four (4) were issued with NOA/MOA within 2017. TIEZA requested to retain its proposed target of 5 projects considering that it would take 321 days from Board approval to NOA. Further, TIEZA avers that five (5) of the Board-approved projects are in deadlock due to inaction of the LGUs concerned and without fault on TIEZA. To clarify, the target set under the GCG-modified scorecard was based on the 2016 reported accomplishment of TIEZA wherein 10 ecotourism projects were approved by the Board per Board Resolution No. R-04-11-16. The consideration to use the previous year accomplishment, in this case the 2016 accomplishment, is due to the representation of TIEZA that it takes 321 days from Board approval to issuance of NOA. Since the 10 ecotourism projects were approved in 2016, it was expected that the issuance of NOA would ensue in 2017 considering the 321-day timeline reported by TIEZA. Further, this is already a minimal target as it does not</p>

## Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Objective / Measure		Component			Target	TIEZA Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
		Formula	Wt.	Rating Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
											include yet the backlogs of TIEZA. In this regard, the request to lower the target to five (5) sites was <b>DENIED</b> . The measure only merits 4% of its full weight of 10%.
<b>Sub-total</b>			<b>30.0%</b>				<b>28.05%</b>		<b>14.00%</b>		
<b>SO 3 Maximize Absorptive Capacity Based on Approved Plans and Programs</b>											
<b>FINANCIAL</b>	<b>SM 4</b>	Allotment Utilization Index: Value of Tourism Infrastructure Projects issued with Notice of Award as per Allocated Amount of Board-Approved Projects within a 1 year period	Amount of projects issued with Notice of Award / Total allocated Board-approved projects within 1-year period	7.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	65%	62.81%	4.71%	3.18%	0.37%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NOA and MOA of the projects</li> </ul> <p>The projects were verified against the list of 2016 Board-approved projects, with a total value of ₱1.34 Billion, as submitted by TIEZA in relation to its 2016 PBB application. Based on our evaluation, out of 14 projects reported by TIEZA, only 3 projects which were approved by the Board in 2016 were issued with MOA/NOA during the Performance Year 2017. The 3 projects, namely: (1) Development of Ecotourism Projects, Belvedere, Fertig Hills, Tangub City; (2) Access Road to Kinuskusan Hilltop Convention Center, Baisalan, Davao del Sur; and, (3) Consultancy Services for Masterplanning of Siargao Island, Siargao, with a total value of ₱42.46 Million.</p> <p>In view of this, TIEZA only achieved 3.18% allotment utilization index. This is</p>

## Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Objective / Measure	Component		Rating Scale	Target	TIEZA Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
	Formula	Wt.		2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
										equivalent to 0.37% out of the full rating of 7.50%.
<b>SO 4</b>	<b>Achieve Financial Viability and Sustainability of Assets</b>									
SM 5	Net Income from All Operating Entities	Gross Revenues from all operating entities less operating expenditures (before depreciation)	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight 0% = if ₱76.63 Million and below	₱85 Million	₱90.68 Million	10%	₱90.68 Million	10%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Summary of TIEZA's Financial Report for the Operating Assets</li> </ul> <p>Reported accomplishment is acceptable. TIEZA exceeded the target. However, it was noted that three of its operating assets incurred net losses, and these are: Balicasag Island Dive Resort, Club Intramuros Golf Course, and Lights and Sounds Museum.</p> <p>The request to change the rating scale to "(Actual/Target) x Weight" is hereby <b>APPROVED, BUT WITH MODIFICATION</b>. Instead of the graduated rating scale initially set, the Governance Commission hereby revises the rating scale to "(Actual/Target) x Weight"; however, a 0% rating will be given if the accomplishment is ₱76.63 Million and below. This is to ensure that TIEZA will only be given a merit if the 2017 accomplishment exceeds the 2016 actual net income of ₱76.63 Million.</p>
	<b>Sub-total</b>		<b>17.5%</b>				<b>14.71%</b>		<b>10.37%</b>	

Objective / Measure	Component		Target		TIEZA Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
	Formula	Wt.	Rating Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
<b>SO 5</b>	<b>Institutionalize a TIEZA Brand Anchored on Transparency, Efficiency, and Quality of Service, and Being Environment Friendly and Filipino-Themed for Projects</b>										
CUSTOMERS/STAKEHOLDERS  SM 6	Stakeholders Satisfaction for all Services	% of stakeholders who rated TIEZA service as Satisfactory (rating of 4 and 5 in a 5-point rating scale) / Total no. of stakeholders surveyed	5%	All or Nothing	Establish Baseline	Notice of Award Draft Report to be delivered on April 2018	5%	No accomplishment	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NOA to ASCEND</li> <li>• Draft Inception Report</li> </ul>	<p>TIEZA requested to retain its proposed target to establish a baseline for customers' satisfaction survey only to travel tax payers in NAIA 3. TIEZA argued that it has to go through the Government Procurement Law to engage a third-party surveyor. In a letter dated 29 January 2018, the request for modification was not considered. However, TIEZA was advised that circumstances presented in their letter may be considered during the evaluation of its annual performance. It is noted that in its reported annual accomplishment, TIEZA was not able to conduct the survey even to travel tax payers as it had previously appealed. Considering that this measure is a standard requirement across GOCCs under the jurisdiction of GCG and that no survey was accomplished for the year, 0% score is awarded for this measure.</p>
<b>Sub-total</b>		<b>5.0%</b>					<b>5.0%</b>		<b>0.0%</b>		

Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

	Objective / Measure	Component			Target	TIEZA Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
		Formula	Wt.	Rating Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
INTERNAL PROCESS	SO 6	Implemented Automated Information System										
	SM 7a	Information Systems integrated (TIMBA)	Actual Accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Implementation of Budget Management Monitoring System	User Accepted System	5%	Implemented the Budget and Management Monitoring System	5%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Certificate of Acceptance</li> <li>• User acceptance Certification</li> <li>• Attendance Sheet on the iBMMS Testing and Training</li> <li>• UAT</li> </ul>	Acceptable.  The Governance Commission further suggests that TIEZA should establish its complete project sign-off documents in its subsequent projects, which includes a Project Closure and Acceptance Form.
	SM 7b	Development of the New Integrated Automated Information System	Actual Accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	ManCom Approved New Integrated Information System	Mancom Approved System	5%	ManCom Approved Framework for the New Integrated Information System	5%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Memorandum dated 21 December 2017 on the Conceptual Framework for TIEZA's IT System approved by the Management Committee</li> <li>• Copy of the approved Conceptual Framework for the Development and Implementation of TIEZA's IT Systems</li> </ul>	Acceptable.

Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Objective / Measure		Component			Target	TIEZA Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
		Formula	Wt.	Rating Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
SO 7	Rationalize Development and Management of TEZs and Key TIEZA Assets and Projects										
SM 8	Percent of Milestones Achieved in the TEZ Flagship Program Against the Target Within the Year	Weight of milestones achieved over total weight of target milestones	10%	Milestone/s achieved	100% of targeted milestones	100%	10%	85%	8.50%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Terms of Reference for the Master Planning of Corregidor</li> <li>Secretary's Certificate (excerpt from the minutes of Board meeting approving the designation of Panglao Bay Premiere Flagship TEZ and approval of its CTMP)</li> </ul>	Validated actual was based on the milestones provided by TIEZA per its letter to GCG dated 08 May 2017. Details of validation is presented in Appendix A.
SM 9	Percentage of TEZ Applications Processed on Time	(Number of TEZ applications processed within 150 working days over total no. of TEZ applications received) x 100	7.5%	(Actual/Target) x Weight	75%	100%	7.5%	Measure removed	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Summary of the timeline of applications per project, including the correspondences between TIEZA and the proponents</li> </ul>	Of the five (5) applications received in 2017, three (3) were filed beyond June; hence, the processing would go beyond 2017 considering the 150-working day processing time. Two (2) applications were submitted before the end of June but were not processed pending submission of documents from the proponent despite follow-up letters from TIEZA. In this regard, the measure was removed for the year.

## Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Objective / Measure	Component		Wt.	Rating Scale	Target	TIEZA Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
	Formula	2017			Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
<b>SO 8</b>	<b>Quality Management System</b>										
SM 10	ISO Certification	Actual Accomplishment	For target (a): 5.00% For target (b): 5:00%	All or nothing	a. ISO 9001:2008 Certification maintained and b. Readiness Assessment for ISO 9001:2015	a. ISO 9001:2008 Certification maintained b. Readiness ISO 9001:2015	5% 5%	a. ISO 9001:2008 maintained b. Readiness Assessment	5% 5%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>TUV Rheinland Audit Report</li> <li>Gap Assessment Report</li> </ul>	Acceptable. The scope of the ISO 9001:2008 certification covers the following processes: (1) Provision of Assets Management; (2) Tourism Infrastructure Project Management; and (3) Travel Tax Administration Services.
<b>Sub-total</b>			<b>37.5%</b>				<b>37.5%</b>		<b>28.50%</b>		
<b>SO 9</b>	<b>Build and Strengthen Human and Organizational Capabilities</b>										
SM 11	Required Competency Complied	a. Establish Baseline (SG17 and below) b. No. of Managers and Supervisors with individual Career and Development Plan / Total No. of Managers and Supervisors with Established Competency Profile	For target (a): 5.00% For target (b): 5.00%	(Actual/Target) x Weight	a. Establish Competency Baseline for 246 employees (SG 17 & below) b. Board-approved Training Plan for 160 employees (Managers & Supervisors)	a. Establish Baseline for 246 employees b. Board-approved training plan	a. 5% b. 5%	a. Target removed b. Board-approved training plan	a. - b. 5%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Summary of competency assessment profiling</li> <li>Board-approved training plan</li> <li>Board Resolution No. R-19-12-17-A dated 19 December 2017 approving the Training Plan</li> </ul>	TIEZA reported that it was able to accomplish the two (2) targets under this measure, namely: (1) establish the competency baseline for 246 employees with Salary Grade (SG) 17 and below; and (2) to submit a Board-approved training plan for 160 employees occupying managerial and supervisory positions. As regards the first target, the CGO-A gathered during the onsite validation that TIEZA was able to conduct the assessment in 2016 for most of the employees occupying SG 17 and below and that the assessment was completed in the first quarter of 2017. This was validated in the submitted list



Validation Result of 2017 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component				Target	TIEZA Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure		Formula	Wt.	Rating Scale	2017	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating	
										<p>of profiled employees. In the said document, 27 employees were assessed in 2017 out of the 246 employees under SG 17 and below, while the rest were assessed in 2016.</p> <p>However, we find that the accomplishment in 2017, which was the conduct of assessment for the remaining 27 employees under SG 17 and below, was not enough to warrant a full rating of 5%. It is in this context that the GCG removed this target in the 2017 Performance Scorecard. However, we took note of TIEZA's effort in completing the baseline in 2017 and the same shall be taken into consideration in the crafting of succeeding Performance Scorecards.</p> <p>On the other hand, the training plan was found acceptable and 5% was given for this accomplishment.</p>
<b>Sub-total</b>			<b>10.0%</b>				<b>10.0%</b>		<b>5.00%</b>	
<b>TOTAL</b>			<b>100%</b>				<b>95.26%</b>		<b>57.87% out of 87.5%</b>	
<b>VALIDATED RATING</b>									<b>66.14% out of 100%</b>	

✓