

**PHILIPPINE RECLAMATION AUTHORITY (PRA)  
Validation Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard**

		Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure		Formula	Weight	2018		Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
SOCIAL IMPACT	SO 1	Increase Number of Environmentally Sound Buildable Areas for Development										
	SM 1	Attain Government Seabed Quarry Permit (GSQP) for Bulacan-Pampanga-Bataan; Leyte-Biliran; Malapascua of Cebu; Maasin of Leyte; and, Oton-Guimaras Coastal Waters for Marine Sand Quarry	Actual accomplishment	10%	All or Nothing	Conduct of the following activities: a) Seismic Profiling b) Bathymetric Profiling c) Water Sampling and Sediment Sampling	Partial accomplishment <sup>1</sup>	0%	No conduct of Seismic Profiling, Bathymetric Profiling, Water Sampling and Sediment Sampling.	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Internal Memo recommending to the BAC the proposed Government-to-Government Arrangement between PRA and MGB for the conduct of Offshore and Geo-Scientific Marine Quarry activities dated 31 August 2018</li> <li>Submission of MGB of the Revised Technical and Financial Proposal dated 13 August 2018</li> </ul>	Target not met. There was a delay in the finalization of the contract with the DENR-MGB.

<sup>1</sup> Recommended to the BAC the proposed Government-to-Government Arrangement between PRA and MGB for the conduct of Offshore and Geo-Scientific Marine Quarry activities. Submission of MGB of the Revised Technical and Financial Proposal.

Validation Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight			2018	Actual	Rating	Score			Rating
SM 2	Completion of the Preparatory Activities for Land Reclamation	Actual accomplishment	10%	All or Nothing	Hire consultant for the conduct of Feasibility Study (FS) Environmental Impact Study (EIS), and drafting of Terms of Reference for Detailed Engineering Design (DED)	Partial accomplishment <sup>2</sup>	0%	Failed bidding	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• BAC Resolution No. CONS 18-050 recommendation to declare a failure of bidding dated 10 September 2018</li> <li>• Secretary Certificate on Board Resolution No. 4857 dated 25 April 2018 approving the bid documents</li> <li>• Secretary's Certificates on Board Resolution Nos. 4883 dated 21 May 2018 and 4917 dated 21 September 2018 declaring failure of the first and second bidding</li> </ul>	Target not met.

<sup>2</sup> Revision of the Terms of Reference (TOR), Recommendation of revised TOR to the PRA Board for approval, Declaration of failure of the second bidding, and PRA Board approval of the new (3<sup>rd</sup>) public bidding.

Validation Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight		2018	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
<b>SO 2 Integrate a Comprehensive Coastal Defense/Protection Strategy into Developmental Plans</b>											
SM 3	Coastal Defense Strategy for Vulnerable Areas	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Submission of Final Report to Global Resilience Partnership (GRP) through One Architecture for Tacloban City and Palo, Leyte; and, Submission of Inception Report and Acceptance and approval of at least one LGU of Framework Plan for the Coastal Protection Master Plan (CPMP)	Partial accomplishment <sup>3</sup>	0%	No reports submitted	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• GRP email granting a No-Cost extension to the project and Contract Addendum 5 between One Architecture and KPMG</li> <li>• Secretary's Certificates on the Approval to enter and sign the Expression of Collaboration (EOC) between Bislig City and Surigao City</li> <li>• Signed Expression of Collaboration between Bislig and Surigao</li> </ul>	Targets not met. There was a delay in the implementation of the mangrove planting project at Tacloban City due to land title issue concerning the pilot site. Moreover, negotiations on the Framework Plan for the CPMP with the Bislig and Surigao LGUs were still on-going by end of 2018.

<sup>3</sup> a.1) Planting activities were completed; a.2) Livelihood training program was conducted; a.3) GRP granted a No-Cost extension to the project; a.4) Final Report is due at the end of February 2019; b.1) Expressions of Collaboration (EOC) between PRA and Cities of Surigao and Bislig were finalized; b.2) Initiated discussion and negotiation with the Dutch Embassy for possible technical assistance (capacity building for PRA) for the formulation of a CPMP.

Validation Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight		2018	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
SO 3 Increase Support of Stakeholders, Address Concerns of Affected Communities and Gain Social Acceptance of Development Projects											
SM 4	Percentage of Satisfied Customers	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing Lower than 80% = 0%	Establish Baseline	CSS Baseline Report was submitted to the Board last December 11, 2018. Per said Report, 81% of PRA Customers are satisfied with PRA services.	5%	Methodology and Questionnaire are not compliant with the Standard Methodology and Prescribed Questionnaire issued by GCG	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Final Report on PRA 2018 Stakeholder Satisfaction Survey</li> <li>2018 List of Respondents for PRA</li> <li>Attendance Sheet for PRA Customers Consultation Meeting dated 30 July 2018</li> <li>MOA between PRA and DAP on customer satisfaction survey</li> </ul>	<p>Method used was not in accordance with GCG Standard Methodology:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Part IV Item 1. Respondent Criteria - Survey covered years 2017 and 2018, analysis of result did not properly identify the rating of 2017 and 2018 customers.</li> <li>Part IV Item 3 (d) – Sample size should be 100 with Margin of Error +/-9.8% at 95% confidence level</li> <li>PRA modified the GCG questionnaire by adding a question on Importance Rating before the Overall Satisfaction Rating. FAQs on the GCG Standardized Customer Satisfaction Survey published in the GCG website provides that GOCCs are not allowed to modify the questionnaire prescribed by the GCG. However, GOCCs may add questions specific for</li> </ol>

## Validation Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component				Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight	2018			Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
											its operations but only under Part II (Service Execution portion) of the questionnaire.	
		<b>Sub-total</b>	<b>30%</b>				<b>5%</b>		<b>0%</b>			
<b>SO 4 Increase Revenue and Improve Cash Flow</b>												
FINANCE	SM 5	Net Income Commitment	Absolute amount	15%	(Actual/Target) x Weight	₱250 Million <sup>4</sup>	₱421 Million	15%	₱230.38 Million	13.82%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Copy of unaudited Income Statement for 2018</li> </ul>	Target not met. The GCG-validated actual accomplishment was based on the unaudited Income Statement.
	SM6a	Disposition of Properties to Minimize Expense: Bacolod Properties	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Final disposition of Bacolod Properties	Partial accomplishment <sup>5</sup>	0%	Bacolod Properties were not disposed	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Report on the Market Assessment</li> <li>Lot Plan of the PRA properties at BREDCO</li> <li>Secretary's Certificate on Board Resolution No. 4951 declaring a failure of bidding for the lease of BREDCO property</li> <li>Notice to Proceed for the determination of the properties' current fair market value</li> </ul>	Target not met. PRA was not able to dispose its Bacolod properties due to absence of interested bidders.

<sup>4</sup> Using new accounting policy involving PFRS standards on revenue recognition (cash basis to accrual basis) that was adopted by PRA starting 2017.

<sup>5</sup> Assessed bidding terms versus actual market demand through: (a) Market assessment for four (4) properties, (b) Board approved marketing plan, and (c) appraisal of fair market values by appraisal firms procured through Small Value Procurement. For the lease of Bacolod Properties, Bidding was conducted on December 12, 2018. Result was Failed Bidding due to non-submission of any bidder.

## Validation Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component					Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure		Formula	Weight	2018		Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
											<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Secretary's Certificate re: Approval of Proposed Option 2 for the lease of four (4) PRA properties located at the BREDCO Reclamation area in Bacolod City</li> </ul>	
SM6b	Disposition of Properties to Minimize Expense: Esplanade Properties	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Collection of lease of Esplanade	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Annual rent for lease of Esplanade due and collected from SM Prime Holdings on 21 June 2018 in the amount of ₱28.2 Million.</li> <li>3<sup>rd</sup> Negotiation talks with Salem Investment Corporation is ongoing.</li> </ul>	0%	Annual rent for lease of Esplanade collected from SM Prime Holdings on 21 June 2018 in the amount of ₱28.2 Million	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Copy of Salem-PRA correspondence</li> <li>Consultation letter with COA</li> <li>Lot Plan of the PRA properties leased by Salem</li> <li>Official receipt on the collection of lease from SM Prime</li> <li>Copy of lease contract with the SM Prime</li> </ul>	Target not met. 0% score is confirmed due to All or Nothing rating scale.	

## Validation Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component		Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks			
Objective / Measure	Formula		Weight	2018	Actual	Rating	Score			Rating		
<b>SO 5 Increase Inventory of Marketable Land Areas</b>												
INTERNAL PROCESS	SM 7	Disposition of Unlawfully Reclaimed Areas	Absolute number	10%	(Actual/Target) x Weight	10 Board-approved applications to DENR for its recommendation or the issuance of Presidential Proclamation	Five (5) Board approved applications: Prepared CSW for said approved applications and endorsed to the appropriate DENR office for issuance of Presidential Proclamation (PP) / Special Patent (SP) pursuant to DENR-DAO 2018-14 Guidelines	0%	PRA endorsed four (4) Board-approved applications to the DENR for the issuance of Presidential Proclamation.	4%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Secretary's Certificates approving the regularization and Titling of Reclaimed Land</li> <li>Letter to DENR Regional Offices, endorsing the issuance of Presidential Proclamation on the reclaimed lands</li> </ul>	Reported accomplishment of five revised to 4 as 1 project was counted twice.
	<b>Sub-total</b>			<b>35%</b>				<b>15%</b>		<b>17.82%</b>		
<b>SO 6 Implement Clear and Efficient Reclamation Guidelines and Public Estates Development and Management</b>												
INTERNAL PROCESS	SM 8	Programmatic Environmental Assessment, Planning, and Engineering Studies: Manila Bay	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Hire consultant for development of a Decision Support System pertaining to Manila Bay	Third bidding (first negotiated procurement) declared a failure by the BAC on February 2018; Started the second negotiated procurement (after two failed biddings) in the third quarter (September) of 2018. Based on	0%	No consultant was hired	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Terms of Reference (Consultancy Services for the Programmatic Environmental Assessment, Planning and Engineering Studies for the Coastal Adaptation Strategy Formulation in the Manila Bay Area</li> </ul>	Target not met. PRA encountered failed bidding due to ineligibility of the bidders. However, by the end of 2018, PRA finally had two (2) eligible bidders for the project.

Validation Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component					Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure		Formula	Weight	2018		Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
							the revised schedule of BAC, the deadline for submission of bids (Technical and Financial Proposals) was moved to 8 January 2019, hence, bidding process is ongoing.				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Internal Memoranda to BAC requesting for review of the revised bid documents dated 08 June 2018 and 19 June 2018</li> <li>Request for Expression of Interest for the Negotiated Procurement initially published on 07 September 2018</li> </ul>	
SM 9	Formulation of a New Policy	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Publication of approved mechanics on conduct of Swiss Challenge in the form of an Administrative Order in newspapers of general circulation and filing with UP Law Center	The PRA Board approved the "Guidelines and Procedures for the Competitive Challenge for Unsolicited Proposals to Reclaim" on 11 December 2018 under Board Resolution No. 9499 s. 2018.	0%	Board-approved mechanics on the conduct of Swiss Challenge was not published in 2018	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Internal Memorandum regarding the Draft Guidelines and Procedures for the Competitive Challenge for Unsolicited Proposals to Reclaim</li> <li>Secretary's Certification on the deferral of the Draft Guidelines and Procedures for the Competitive Challenge for further study</li> <li>Secretary's Certificate approving the</li> </ul>	Target not met. While PRA reported that its Board was able to approve the new policy on the conduct of Swiss Challenge on 12 December 2018, the publication of the same did not happen in 2018.	

Validation Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component					Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure		Formula	Weight	2018		Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
											guidelines and procedures for the competitive challenge for unsolicited proposals to reclaim <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Board-approved Guidelines and Procedures</li> <li>• Official Receipt for the publication</li> <li>• Copy of published guidelines in newspaper</li> </ul>	
SM 10	Public Estates Development: Re-development of Coastal Plaza Condominium	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Board-approved Business Plan with concrete timeline of activities and deliverables per year	Presented to Management the proposed redevelopment plan. Business plan was finalized and presented to the Board for their approval. The Board directed resubmission of the revised strategies.	0%	Board approval of the Business Plan was not secured	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Preliminary draft of the Business Plan</li> </ul>	Target not met.	

## Validation Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component					Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure		Formula	Weight	2018		Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
SM 11a	Maintenance and Timely Repair of Roads and Other Infrastructure Projects: Construction of Two Roads at Superblock B	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Hire consultant for Civil works	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Revision of bidding documents for hiring consultant for civil works and complete detailed engineering design is ongoing</li> <li>PRA sent letter (Permit to Construct) to Benito and Sons on September 2, 2018 informing them that they may already commence the construction of one (1) internal road.</li> </ul>	0%	No consultant was hired	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Benito and Sons letter to PRA dated 08 March 2018</li> <li>PRA's letter to Benito and Sons dated 21 Sept 2018 finally approving the road construction</li> <li>Secretary's Certificate for Board Resolution No. 4913 s. 2018 approving the road construction by Benito and Sons</li> </ul>	Target not met.	
SM 11b	Maintenance and Timely Repair of Roads and Other Infrastructure Projects: Rehabilitation of PDMB (President Diosdado Macapagal Boulevard), ASEAN Avenue, and Diokno Boulevard	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Complete Detailed Engineering Services		0%	Detailed Engineering not completed	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Internal Report dated 02 July 2018 on the accomplishment of the Road Repair Works</li> </ul>	Target not met.	
<b>Sub-total</b>			<b>25%</b>				<b>0%</b>		<b>0%</b>			

Validation Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component		Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks			
Objective / Measure	Formula			Weight	Actual	Rating	Score			Rating		
ORGANIZATION	<b>SO 7 Strengthen Culture of Continuous Training and Innovation in the Organization</b>											
	SM 12	Percentage of Employees Meeting Required Competencies	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Board-approved Competency-Based Job Descriptions for all positions	Competency-Based Job Descriptions for all (290) positions was approved by the Board last December 11, 2018	5%	Board-approved Manual of Competencies and Competency-Based Job Descriptions for all positions	5%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Secretary's Certificate for Board Resolution No. 4943 series of 2018</li> <li>PRA's Manual of Competencies</li> <li>Competency Based Job Description for 290 positions</li> </ul>	Acceptable.
	<b>SO 8 Implement a Quality Management System</b>											
	SM 13	Improve Processes to Quality to Management System	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Certification under ISO 9001:2015	Certificate for ISO 9001:2015 was issued dated 8 November 2018	5%	Certification under ISO 9001:2015	5%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ISO Certificate 9001:2015 (AJA18-0160)</li> <li>Notice of Award, Notice to Proceed, and PRA-AJA Registrars Contract for the Consultancy Services of ISO 9001:2015 (sgd. 14 Sept 2018)</li> <li>Copy of PRA's Audit Program 2018</li> </ul>	Acceptable.
<b>Sub-total</b>			<b>10%</b>				<b>10%</b>		<b>10%</b>			
<b>TOTAL</b>			<b>100%</b>				<b>30%</b>		<b>27.82%</b>			

1-