

**PHILIPPINE RECLAMATION AUTHORITY (PRA)
Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard**

		Component				PRA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating				
SOCIAL IMPACT/STAKEHOLDERS	SO 1	Increase Number of Environmentally Sound Buildable Areas for Development										
	SM 1	Secure Approval of Government Seabed Quarry Permit (GSQP) for Lubang Island Simo Banks-Nasugbu; Leyte-Biliran; Malapascua of Cebu; Maasin of Leyte; and Oton-Guimaras Coastal Waters for Marine Sand Quarry	<i>Measure Excluded</i>				No PRA concurrence on Final Report yet. The Implementing Agreement is not yet finalized. PRA is still awaiting the following: 1) DENR-MGB's response to the PRA's latest comments on the revised Implementing Agreement; and 2) Revised proposal/costing on the conduct of geo-scientific survey and investigation.	-	<i>Measure Excluded</i>		Timeline/Chronology of Events with Supporting Documents	The Governance Commission GRANTS the request of the PRA to exclude the measure in consideration of the factors and circumstances beyond the control of the corporation, such as the review of the DENR-MGB of the IA.
	SM 2	Implementation of Land Reclamation Activities:										
SM 2a	Pasay 360-Hectare Reclamation	Actual Accomplishment	7.50%	All or Nothing	100% Completion of the 2021 Deliverables per Project Timeline	The 2021 deliverables to monitor the project mobilization activities and to	0%	2021 Deliverables Not Completed	0%	Narrative and Justifications for the Validation of PRA's CY 2021 Performance	Target not met. Under the submitted Project Timeline, the 2021 deliverables of the PRA are the monitoring of the reclamation project implementation and the	

¹ Based on the revised 4th Quarter Monitoring Report submitted by the PRA through a letter dated 10 November 2022. Officially received by the Governance Commission on 11 November 2022.

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of PRA (Annex A)

Component						PRA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
						request issuance of presidential proclamation and special patent were not accomplished.				Evaluation Scorecard	request of issuance of a Presidential Proclamation and Special Patent. For 2021, the PRA reported that "[it] was only able to accomplish the final review and evaluation of the pre-construction plans and documents, a stage prior project mobilization which shall be the subject of the monitoring" and that "the issuance of presidential proclamation and special patent was categorically not accomplished". Thus, the Governance Commission awarded a 0% rating for the measure.
SM 2b	Navotas City Reclamation	Actual Accomplishment	7.50%	All or Nothing	100% Completion of the 2021 Deliverables per Project Timeline	The 2021 deliverable to monitor the project mobilization activities was not accomplished.	0%	2021 Deliverables Not Completed	0%	Narrative and Justifications for the Validation of PRA's CY 2021 Performance Evaluation Scorecard	At the onset, the Governance Commission notes that the PRA proposed the Navotas City Reclamation and Batangas City Reclamation as the projects for monitoring in the 2021 Performance Scorecard of the corporation. Considering that the Performance Evaluation System (PES) not only entails the crafting of annual measures and targets but also embodies within it a system of monitoring and evaluation, the adoption of the proposal of the PRA followed the assumption that based on the internal monitoring of the PRA, such
SM 2c	Batangas City Reclamation	Actual Accomplishment	7.50%	All or Nothing	100% Completion of the 2021 Deliverables per Project Timeline	The 2021 deliverable to monitor the project mobilization activities was not accomplished.	0%	2021 Deliverables Not Completed	0%		

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of PRA (Annex A)

Component					PRA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
										<p>reclamation projects were ready for implementation.</p> <p>Moreover, the Governance Commission notes that the project timeline for the reclamation projects were internally crafted. The Governance Commission finds that the non-adherence of the PRA to its own project timelines shows poor planning and execution of the corporation.</p> <p>Considering the foregoing, the request for the substitution of the Navotas City Reclamation project to the Pasay Harbor City Reclamation project and Reclamation and the Batangas City Reclamation project to Manila Solar City Reclamation project is hereby DENIED.</p>	
SO 2 Promote and Integrate a Comprehensive Coastal Defense/Protection Strategy into Development Plans											
SM 3	Coastal Defense Strategy for Vulnerable Areas	Actual Accomplishment	10%	Milestones ²	Secure Approval from the LGU of Baras, Catanduanes for the Coastal Protection Strategy Endorsed by PRA and its Partners	Two of the milestone measures were achieved: 1) Execution of the Expression of Collaboration [For Baras - executed on December 2, 2020; For Virac - executed on June 28,	5%	Two (2) of the Four (4) Milestones Accomplished	5%	<p>Signed Expression of Collaboration with the LGU of Baras, Cantaduanes</p> <p>Report on the Ocular Inspection, Stakeholders' Consultation and Data</p>	<p>Target not met.</p> <p>The submitted supporting documents substantiated the accomplishment of the first two (2) milestones of the target.</p>

² See Appendix A for milestone-based rating system.

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of PRA (Annex A)

Component					PRA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
					2021]; 2) Identification of study area and environmental scanning (ocular) were conducted [Actual site inspection, environmental scanning, verification and validation of secondary data, and stakeholders meeting were conducted on May 9-16, 2021; Risk and Hazard Assessment Workshop was conducted on June 4, 2021; and Institutional Setting Workshop was conducted on June 21, 2021]				Gathering for the Proposed Coastal Management Strategy (CMS) Roadmap Report on DRR Catanduanes by Royal Haskoning DHV Internal Memorandum on the DRR Mission		
SO 3 Increase Support of Stakeholders, Address Concerns of Affected Communities and Gain Social Acceptance of Development Projects											
SM 4	Percentage of Satisfied Customers	Actual Accomplishment	5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight 0% = If Less Than 80%	90%	Overall average satisfaction rating of 4.44/5 with 90.54% of PRA stakeholders	5%	Joint Venture Partners: 100% Lessees/ Buyers: 88.24%	3.30%	Final Customer Satisfaction Survey Report	Target not met. The Governance Commission divided the 5% weight of the measure per customer segment to give equal merit to

142

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of PRA (Annex A)

Component					PRA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks		
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating				
					satisfied (weighted) and 4.46/5 with 91.89% of PRA stakeholders satisfied (unweighted)		Permittees: 75%		Accomplished Survey Forms	the satisfaction survey results of each customer segment. The customer satisfaction survey results of Joint Venture Partners were given the full weight of 1.67% while the survey results of Lessees/ Buyers were given a weight of 1.63%. The result of the survey from permittees was given a zero rating.		
Sub-total		47.50%				10%		8.30%				
FINANCE	SO 4 Increase Revenue and Improve Cash Flow											
	SM 5	Net Income After Tax Commitment ³	Absolute Amount	15%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	₱541 Million ⁴	₱452.8 Million	12.55%	₱452.80 Million	12.55%	COA Annual Audit Report	Target not met. The PRA is reminded that the Governance Commission shall refer to the COA Annual Audit Report in the validation of the annual accomplishment of the corporation for this measure.
	SO 5 Increase Inventory of Marketable Land Assets											
	SM 6	Disposition of Unlawfully Reclaimed Areas	Absolute Number	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	Endorsement to the DENR for Issuance of Presidential Proclamation Covering Ten (10) Sites	No endorsement to the DENR for presidential proclamation was made in 2021.	0%	No Sites Endorsed to DENR	0%	Narrative and Justifications for the Validation of PRA's CY 2021 Performance Evaluation Scorecard	Target not met.
Sub-total		25%					12.55%	12.55%				

³ Refers to the Net Income After Tax (NIAT) that is reported to the Commission on Audit (COA) as shown in PRA's Statement of Comprehensive Income.

⁴ Based on PRA's submitted 2021 Corporate Operating Budget (COB).

Jan

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of PRA (Annex A)

	Component				PRA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
	Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual			Rating
	SO 6	Implement Clear and Efficient Reclamation Guidelines and Public Estates Development Management									
INTERNAL PROCESS	SM 7	Formulation of a New Policy	Actual Accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Publication of Board-Approved Policy on PRA Monitoring of the Non-Environmentally Critical Projects in Newspapers of General Circulation and Filing with Office of the National Administrative Register (ONAR)	The finalization of the policy is still ongoing.	-	Policy on Monitoring of the Non-Environmentally Critical Projects was Not Published in Newspapers of General Circulation and Filed with ONAR	0%	<p>Narrative and Justifications for the Validation of PRA's CY 2021 Performance Evaluation Scorecard</p> <p>Target not met.</p> <p>The Governance Commission notes that in its letter dated 29 July 2021,⁵ the PRA requested to revise the target to "Policies and Guidelines Governing the Social Environmental Fund (SEF) Collected from Reclamation Projects". The request to revise the target was made as the PRA represented that the issuance of the proposed revised policy has been the priority of the corporation since 2016.</p> <p>The Governance Commission notes that under the 2020 Performance Scorecard, the target of PRA for the same measure is the "Publication of Board-Approved Utilization Guidelines on the Social Environmental Fund (SEF) in Newspapers of General Circulation and Filing with UP Law Center". Likewise, the PRA reported the accomplishment of the target on 18 June 2021 during the validation of the 2020 Performance Scorecard. However, such was not considered as an accomplishment as the target was completed beyond the</p>

⁵ Officially received by the Governance Commission on 02 August 2021.

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of PRA (Annex A)

Objective/Measure		Component				PRA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
		Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
											<p>performance year being evaluated.</p> <p>The PRA also represented that the non-accomplishment of the target was due to the rigorous preliminary drafting works of the policy and the additional stage prior to finalization of the policy pursuant to the new issuance of the Anti-Red Tape Authority (ARTA) on Risk Impact Assessment (RIA).</p> <p>The Governance Commission notes that the PRA proposed the 2021 target. Similar with the findings in SM 2b and SM 2c, the non-accomplishment of the measure was not due to external factors beyond the control of the PRA. The non-accomplishment of the measure can be attributed to the poor planning and execution of the corporation.</p> <p>Foregoing considered, the request to revise the measure is hereby DENIED.</p>
SM 8	Re-development of Coastal Plaza Condominium Project (CPCP)									<p>Copy of Application for the Alteration of Condominium Plan</p> <p>Memorandum for the Board of Directors on</p>	<p>Based on the representations of the PRA during the onsite validation and the review of the submitted supporting documents, the Governance Commission found that the non-accomplishment of the mutually exclusive milestones was due to the following factors</p>

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of PRA (Annex A)

Component					PRA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure		Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual		
						Plan (ASDP) on July 7, 2021.				the Approval of the Recised Timetable for the Approved Re-Development Plan of the Coastal Plaza Condomium beyond the control of the corporation: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The PRA encountered securing a conforme from the simple majority of the registered unit owners to the proposed alteration, which is one of the requirements in the approval of the alteration of the site development plan, due to the passing of the unit owners of the sale of the units to third parties without advising the PRA; • The belated action of the DHSUD to the Application for the Alteration of Condominium Plan; and • The loss of DHSUD of the files of the registration of the CPCP as a condominium project. In consideration of the aforementioned factors, the Governance Commission excluded the measure in the 2021 Performance Scorecard of PRA.
SM 9	Maintenance and Timely Repair of Roads and Other Infrastructure Projects:									

Handwritten signature/initials

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of PRA (Annex A)

Component					PRA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
SM 9a	Rehabilitation of PRA Roads through Agency-to-Agency Implementation	Actual Accomplishment	5%	$\frac{(Actual / Target) \times Weight}{}$	100% Implementation of the 2021 Deliverables in the Memorandum of Agreement with DPWH	0%	No Deliverables Completed	0%	Narrative and Justifications for the Validation of PRA's CY 2021 Performance Evaluation Scorecard	Through a letter dated 29 July 2021, ⁶ the PRA requested the revision of the target and rating system of SM 9a and SM 9b. The request was made considering that the PRA Board opted that the procurement of the rehabilitation of the PRA roads and the construction of the road be managed by the Department of Public Works and Highways (DPWH) and that the delay in the procurement is outside the control of the PRA. However, as explained by the validating team of the Governance Commission during the onsite validation, the shift in the mode of procurement was the decision of the corporation. Thus, the delay in the procurement for the rehabilitation and construction of roads, which is a consequence of such a decision, is within the control of the PRA.	
SM 9b	Construction of One (1) Road through Agency-to-Agency Implementation				100% Implementation of the 2021 Deliverables in the Memorandum of Agreement with DPWH		The implementation of the 2021 deliverables were not commenced since the MOA was only signed on December 27, 2021.	No Deliverables Completed			0%
SM 9c	Road Repair Works of PRA Roads				100% Completion of Road Repair/ Maintenance Works through Cutting/Squaring		Completed 100% of the Road Repair Works Under PRA's Supervision on 15 September	Cannot Be Validated			0%

⁶ Officially received by the Governance Commission on 02 August 2021.

⁷ Officially received by the Governance Commission on 11 November 2022.

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of PRA (Annex A)

Component					PRA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
					2021				PBINFRA-20-001 Secretary's Certificate for Resolution No. 5307, Series of 2021 Notice of Award for Road Repair Works Along President Diosdado Macapagal Boulevard (PDMB), Asean Avenue, and J.W. Diokno (Bay) Boulevard As Built Plans	in the accomplishment of the SM 9c. It shall be recalled that the Governance Commission requested for documents proving the completion of the project. Albeit the PRA submitted supporting documents, such were deemed insufficient, considering that the PRA engaged the services of a third-party contractor. The acceptable and sufficient documentation for the measure is a Certificate of Completion from the Contractor or Proof of Release of Payment for the Completion of the Project.	
Sub-total		17.50%					3.17%		0%		
ORGANIZATION	SO 7 Strengthen Culture of Continuous Training and Innovation in the Organization										
	SM 10	Percentage of Employees Meeting Required Competencies	Actual Accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Improve Competency Baseline of the Organization ⁸	Improved the PRA's competency from the baseline of 79% to 83% in 2021	5%	Cannot Be Validated	0%	2021 Competency Assessment Report

⁸ The competency baseline of the organization shall pertain to the average percentage of required competencies met which can be computed using the following formula:

$$\frac{\sum_{a=1}^B \left(\frac{\sum_{a=1}^A (\text{Actual Competency Level})_a}{A} \right)}{B}$$

where: a = Competency required, A = Total number of competencies required of position, b = Personnel profiled, B = Total number of personnel profiled

1
1/28

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of PRA (Annex A)

Component					PRA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
									Excel File of the Competency Assessment	subordinate rating, and supervisor rating) of the competency of its employees for 2021. However, based on the review of the competency assessment, the Governance Commission could not determine the equivalent numerical value of the total competency level of each of its employees due to the varied method and rating scale used in the competency analysis per assessment. Consequently, the Governance Commission could not determine the competency level of the organization based on the formula provided (See Footnote 6). The PRA is reminded to follow the formula provided by the Governance Commission to compute the competency baseline of the organization to prevent the non-acceptance of the overall organizational competency rating.	
SO 8 Implement a Quality Management System											
SM 11	Improve Processes to Quality to Management System	Actual Accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Recertification under ISO 9001:2015 Standard	The PRA was re-certified under ISO 9001:2015. The Certificate was issued on December 30, 2021 and shall be valid until November 7, 2024.	5%	ISO 9001:2015 Recertification Obtained	5%	ISO 9001:2015 Certificate Audit Report from SOCOTEC Certification UK	Based on the recertification audit conducted by SOCOTEC on 29 October 2021, the PRA was awarded its ISO 9001:2015 certification. The ISO Certificate was issued on 30 December 2021 and is valid until 07 November 2024.

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of PRA (Annex A)

Component					PRA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
	Sub-total	10%				10%		5%		
	TOTAL	100%			35.72% out of 100%		25.85% out of 82.50% or 31.33% out of 100%			

fu