

**LAGUNA LAKE DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY (LLDA)**  
**Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard**

Component		Rating Scale	Target 2020	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks			
Objective / Measure	Formula			Weight	Actual	Rating <sup>1</sup>	Actual			Rating		
ENVIRONMENTAL / SOCIAL IMPACT	<b>SO 1 Manage and Improve Water Quality Class (Class C)</b>											
	SM 1	Maintain Water Quality of Laguna de Bay	Monthly values [in milligrams per liter (mg/L) Biochemical Oxygen (BOD) / Actual number of months with sampling]	15%	All or Nothing	Within the standard BOD level as prescribed by the DENR	Average BOD level is 3mg/L.	15%	2.43 mg/L	15%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Summary of BOD results per station</li> <li>• Monthly reports of laboratory analysis (ROLA)</li> <li>• Quarterly Certificates of Analysis from Aeronics Incorporated</li> </ul>	Target exceeded. The validated annual average BOD level of 2.43 mg/L is above the standard 7 mg/L BOD prescribed by the DENR for a Class C water body like the Laguna Lake.
	<b>SO 2 Improve Lake Productivity</b>											
	SM 2	Maintain Lake Area Covered by Aquaculture Structures [Net at the End of the Year]	Net area at the end of the year [in hectares (has)]	15%	<9,200 has. to 9,660 has. = 15%  More than 9,660 has. = 0%	9,200 has	As of December 31, 2020: 8,200.48 has. of aquaculture (FP: 5,007.88 + FC 3, 192.8)	15%	8,200.48 has.	15%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Internal Memorandum dated 20 January 2021 – Profile of Aquaculture Structures of the Laguna de Bay</li> <li>• Masterlist of fishpens and fishcages as of December 2020</li> </ul>	Acceptable.
	<b>Sub-total</b>			<b>30%</b>				<b>30%</b>	<b>30%</b>			

<sup>1</sup> Based on LLDA submission.

## Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

		Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
		Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight		2020	Actual	Rating <sup>1</sup>	Actual	Rating		
STAKEHOLDERS	SO 3	Improve Stakeholder Satisfaction										
	SM 3	Percentage of Satisfied Customers	Total number of respondents which gave at least satisfactory rating / Total number of respondents	10%	$(Actual/Target) \times Weight$ <i>0% = If less than 80%</i>	90%	96.48% of the respondents rated LLDA at least Satisfactory Rating	0%	96%	10%	• Final Report from the Development Academy of the Philippines	Acceptable.
	<b>Sub-total</b>			<b>10%</b>				<b>0%</b>		<b>10%</b>		
FINANCIAL	SO 4	Increase Revenues										
	SM 4	Revenue Generation	Sales / Revenue from Operations + Other Revenues	10%	$(Actual / Target) \times Weight$	₱280.63 Million	₱312.412 Million	10%	₱311.12 Million	10%	• Revenue Realization and Budget Performance Report • COA Audit Report	Validated actual based on COA Validated Financial Statements for 2020.
	<b>Sub-total</b>			<b>10%</b>				<b>10%</b>		<b>10%</b>		
INTERNAL PROCESS	SO 5	Streamline Regulatory Processes										
	SM 5	Percentage of Applications for Permits and Licenses Processed within Applicable Processing Time	Total number of permits and licenses issued within applicable processing time/ Total number of applications for permits and licenses received	7.5%	$(Actual / Target) \times Weight$	70%	3,933 permits and clearances issued within applicable processing time out of 4,963 applications received or 79.25%	7.50%	64.71% or our 3,207 out of 4,933 applications were processed within the applicable time	6.93%	• Summary Report • Copy of the Permits and Licenses • Copy of Reply Letters issued to Applicants	Only total 4,956 permit applications were considered. The reported accomplishment for seven (7) applications for Barging Clearance were excluded from the universe since the same is not included in the LLDA's Citizen's Charter – 4 <sup>th</sup> Edition.

Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component			Rating Scale	Target 2020	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight			Actual	Rating <sup>1</sup>	Actual	Rating			
										Details of validation is attached as <b>Appendix 1</b> .	
<b>SO 6 Improve Efficiency in Quasi-Judicial Functions</b>											
SM 6	Percentage of Cases Resolved Through Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR)	Total number of cases resolved through ADR / Total number of unresolved cases as of end of preceding year + new cases for current year	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	50% (Backlog: 961 + 2020 new cases)	508 resolved cases out of 1,951 unresolved cases from January 2019 to December 2020	6.26%	Unverifiable	0 %	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Summary of settled / resolved backlog PHC cases</li> <li>Samples of corresponding supporting documents of a backlog PHC case</li> </ul>	Unverifiable. Discrepancies were found in the total number of resolved cases issued with COC vis-à-vis submitted endorsement letters. Details of validation is attached as <b>Appendix 2</b> .
SM 7	Percentage of Cases Resolved Through Public Hearing Committee (PHC) within Applicable Processing Time	Total number of PHC cases resolved within applicable processing time / Total number of cases endorsed to PHC from July 1 of the previous year to June 30 of the current year	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	50%	Operating w/o LC: 494 out of 1,157 cases resolved within 120 workdays Operating w/o DP: 666 out of 1,517 cases resolved within 170 workdays Water Pollution: 60 out of 114 cases resolved within 120 workdays Refusal of Entry: 0 out of 1 case resolved within 95 workdays	8.75%	The reported accomplishment is not compliant with Republic Act No. 11032.	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Master list of resolved cases through PHC</li> <li>Twenty-two (22) Samples of the corresponding cases</li> <li>LLDA letter to the ARTA dated 23 February 2022</li> </ul>	In the revalidation of the 2019 Performance Scorecard, LLDA was reminded to exert all effort to ensure its compliance with R.A. No. 11032 and that <b>"[t]he same consideration will no longer be applicable moving forward"</b> (emphasis added).  In its letter dated 23 February 2022, the LLDA sought clarification from the Anti-Red Tape Authority. Nevertheless,

Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component		Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target 2020	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
							Actual	Rating <sup>1</sup>	Actual	Rating		
							Total no. of resolved cases is 1,200 out of 2,789 (which include cases with issued resolutions)					considering that the measure requires adherence with the requirement under R.A. No. 11032, the Governance Commission cannot validate the reported accomplishment sans the applicable processing time as provided in the Citizen's Charter.
	SM 8	Percentage of PHC Backlog Cases Resolved	Total number of backlog cases resolved through PHC / Total number of backlog cases	7.5%	(Actual/Target) x Weight	25%	From 2014 to December 2019: 625 out of 4,305 backlog cases resolved	4.36%	12.41% (612 cases out of 4,930 backlog cases)	3.72%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Copy of the summary of settled / resolved backlog PHC cases</li> <li>• Samples of the corresponding supporting documents of a backlog PHC case</li> </ul>	Target not met. Details of validation is attached as <b>Appendix 3</b> .
<b>Sub-total</b>				<b>35%</b>				<b>26.87%</b>		<b>10.65%</b>		
LEARNING AND	<b>SO 7 Develop and Implement Quality Management System (QMS)5</b>											
	SM 9	Attain ISO Certification	Actual Accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	ISO 9001: 2015 Recertification	Successfully completed the annual surveillance audit conducted last 08 September 2020	5.00%	Passed the 2 <sup>nd</sup> Surveillance Audit	5.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Registration Certificate</li> <li>• Registration Schedule</li> <li>• Attestation by SOCOTEC Certification</li> </ul>	Acceptable.

Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component				Rating Scale	Target 2020	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight	Actual			Rating <sup>1</sup>	Actual	Rating			
										Philippines, Inc.	
<b>SO 8 Maintain Motivated and Committed Workforce</b>											
SM 10	Percentage of Employees Meeting Required Competencies	Actual Accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Improve the Competency Baseline of the Organization	There is a significant improvement in the competency baseline of LLDA employees from 74.11% in 2019 to 80.43% in 2020	5.00%	6.32% Improvement in the competency baseline (74.11% to 80.43%)	5.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Memorandum on the Distribution of the Survey Forms dated 09 November 2020</li> <li>2020 Competency Report</li> <li>Comparative Individual ratings for 2020 vs. 2019</li> <li>Samples of Accomplished Competency Assessment Report</li> <li>Individual Ratings (2016, 2018, 2019, and 2020)</li> <li>Learning and Development Interventions</li> </ul>	Validated actual computed based on 2019 baseline of 74.11% of employees meeting required competency and 2020 computation of 80.43% of employees meeting required competency.
<b>SO 9 Automate Processes</b>											
SM 11	Processes for Automation	Actual Accomplishment	5%	Development and Implementation of an Online	Development and Implementation of an online	Launched on June 24, 2020 the LLDA Online Services for LLDA Clearance	5.00%	Developed and implemented the Online Application of LLDA Clearance and	5.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Joint Ventura Agreement with the Cloud Panda, Inc.</li> </ul>	Target met.

## Validation Result of 2020 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component			Rating Scale	Target 2020	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure	Formula	Weight			Actual	Rating'	Actual	Rating		
			Application for LLDA Clearance or Development of Online Submission of Self-Monitoring Report = 2.5%	Application for LLDA Clearance and Development of Online Submission of Self-Monitoring Report	(LC) application and Self Monitoring Report (SMR). Total No. of LC issued as of December 2020: 210 Total No. of SMRs submitted online as of December 2020: 2,239.		Online Self-Monitoring Report		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Screenshots of the application interface</li> <li>• Operational Manual</li> <li>• Summary list of applications received</li> </ul>	
			Development and Implementation of an Online Application for LLDA Clearance and Development of Online Submission of Self-Monitoring Report = 5%							
			<b>Sub-total</b>	<b>15%</b>			<b>15%</b>	<b>15%</b>		
			<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>100%</b>			<b>81.87%</b>	<b>75.65%</b>		

**LAGUNA LAKE DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY (LLDA)**

**Validation Result of SM 5: Percentage of Requests Processed within the Applicable Processing Time**

APPLICATION	AS REPORTED BY LLDA				PER GCG VALIDATION			REMARKS
	PROCESSING TIME (WORKING DAYS)	NO. OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APPLICABLE PROCESSING TIME (APT)	NO. OF APPLICATIONS RECEIVED	PERCENTAGE OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APT	PROCESSING TIME PER LLDA 2020 CITIZEN CHARTER - 3RD EDITION (WORKING DAYS)	NO. OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APT	PERCENTAGE OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APT	
New Discharge Permit (DP)	20	400 (378 approved + 22 letters)	471	84.93%	20	341	72.40%	Validation was based on the turnaround time (TAT) per 2020 Citizen's Charter -4 <sup>th</sup> Edition.  Five (5) applications were unverifiable since the end dates can't be identified; these permits were pending on LLDA's side.
DP Renewal	20	1,748 (1,536 approved + 212 letters)	2,529	69.12%	20	1,266	50.06%	The APT used in the validation was based on the 2020 Citizen's Charter. The 50 applications on the submitted summary were not verifiable since the end dates can't be identified. These permits were pending on LLDA's side.
DP - For Indirect Water Discharger	20	295 (269 approved + 26 letters)	337	87.54%	20	246	73%	Validation was based on the turnaround time (TAT) per 2020 Citizen's Charter -4 <sup>th</sup> Edition.  24 applications were unverifiable since the end dates can't be identified;

APPLICATION	AS REPORTED BY LLDA				PER GCG VALIDATION			REMARKS
	PROCESSING TIME (WORKING DAYS)	NO. OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APPLICABLE PROCESSING TIME (APT)	NO. OF APPLICATIONS RECEIVED	PERCENTAGE OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APT	PROCESSING TIME PER LLDA 2020 CITIZEN CHARTER - 3RD EDITION (WORKING DAYS)	NO. OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APT	PERCENTAGE OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APT	
								these permits were pending on LLDA's side.
DP Revalidation	3	736	736	100.00%	3	729	99.05%	The revalidated copy or proof of seven (7) submitted samples were not included in the submitted documents, hence unverifiable. These applications were excluded in the accomplishment
LLDA Clearance (LC)	20	394 (358 approved +36 letters)	506	77.87%	20	320	63.24%	The APT used in the validation was based on the 2020 Citizen's Charter – 4 <sup>th</sup> Edition. 39 applications were unverifiable due to unavailability of end/stop time, also, these are also pending on LLDA's side.
LC Exemption	20	251 (240 approved + 11 letters)	257	97.67%	20	216	84.05%	The APT used in the validation was based on the 2020 Citizen's Charter 4 <sup>th</sup> Edition. The reported total of application received was 257, upon checking the submitted documents, a total of 216 applications were processed within the applicable time. The end date for the ten (10) permits



APPLICATION	AS REPORTED BY LLDA				PER GCG VALIDATION			REMARKS
	PROCESSING TIME (WORKING DAYS)	NO. OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APPLICABLE PROCESSING TIME (APT)	NO. OF APPLICATIONS RECEIVED	PERCENTAGE OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APT	PROCESSING TIME PER LLDA 2020 CITIZEN CHARTER - 3RD EDITION (WORKING DAYS)	NO. OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APT	PERCENTAGE OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APT	
								reviewed were not verifiable and still pending on LLDA's side.
LC Expansion	20	47 (45 approved + 2 letters)	57	82.00%	20	40	70.18%	<p>The APT used in the validation was based on the 2020 Citizen's Charter 4<sup>th</sup> Edition.</p> <p>LLDA reported to have received 57 applications, however, upon verification, there were only 40 applications were processed within applicable time. The end date for the six (6) permits reviewed were not verifiable and these applications were pending on LLDA's side.</p>
LC Amendment	20	55 (52 approved + 3 letters)	63	74.60%	20	49	77.78%	<p>The APT used in the validation was based on the 2020 Citizen's Charter 4<sup>th</sup> Edition. Two (2) of the included applications in the summary were not verifiable since end dates were not indicated. These were excluded in the accomplishment.</p>

APPLICATION	AS REPORTED BY LLDA				PER GCG VALIDATION			REMARKS
	PROCESSING TIME (WORKING DAYS)	NO. OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APPLICABLE PROCESSING TIME (APT)	NO. OF APPLICATIONS RECEIVED	PERCENTAGE OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APT	PROCESSING TIME PER LLDA 2020 CITIZEN CHARTER - 3RD EDITION (WORKING DAYS)	NO. OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APT	PERCENTAGE OF APPLICATIONS ACTED UPON WITHIN APT	
Barging Clearance	20	7 (7 approved + 0 letter)	7	100.00%	-	-	-	Excluded. Service was not included in the Citizen's Charter
<b>Total</b>		<b>3,933</b>	<b>4,963</b>	<b>79.25%</b>		<b>3,207</b>	<b>64.71%</b>	

9

**Validation Result of SM 6: Percentage of Cases Resolved Through Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR)**

LLDA reported to have resolved 508 cases or 31.30% out of 1,623 unresolved cases from January 2019 to December 2020:

YEAR	NUMBER OF CASES ENDORSED		NUMBER OF ADR CASES RESOLVED			YEAR-END BALANCE (BACKLOG)
	PRIOR YEAR BACKLOG	CURRENT YEAR	TOTAL	COC	PHC	
November 2014		76	76	3	0	3
2015	73	1,631	1,704	129	0	129
2016	1575	1,140	2,715	249	718	967
2017	1748	1,066	2,814	93	107	200
2018	2614	547	3,161	345	101	446
2019	2,715	2,414	5,129	1,100	3,068	4,168
2020	961	662	1,623	208	300	508

As presented in the table above, a total of 208 cases were issued with COC in 2020. The reported number of resolved cases were further verified through random sampling of the 52 samples submitted and found the details on the issuance of the COC consistent with the submitted master list of resolved cases for the year. However, discrepancies were noted on the total number of docketed and number of conducted technical conference monthly summary report versus the masterlist of the unresolved cases for the year 2020, specifically for the month of November:

TOTAL PER MONTHLY SUMMARY REPORT	TOTAL PER MASTERLIST	VARIANCE
115	57	58

For cases resolved through the endorsement to PHC, a total of 300 cases were endorsed to the PHC in 2020 as reported by LLDA. However, the LLDA noted in its 02 March 2022 letter that, “no endorsements were made to the PHC from January to September 2020 in an effort to introduce and adopt exhaustive strategies within the ADR level prior to endorsement to better assist the PHC in the unclogging and disposition of cases and prevention of repetitive actions.” The endorsement to the PHC was only from 30 October 2020 to 29 December 2020, as presented in the submitted endorsement of the LAD to the PHC.

Per representation in the submitted justification for the non-endorsement to the PHC for more than three quarters (January to September 2020), during the annual Divisional workshop of the LLDA-Legal and Adjudication Division (LAD) last 16 September 2020, it was resolved that innovations must be implemented in order to improve its case dispositions from the ADR level to the PHC and the Corporate Legal Affairs, which is in charge of the case prosecution in the regular courts. The LLDA evaluated and identified the points and areas for improvement on its processes, to wit:

*“By 2019, there were substantial endorsements from the Enforcement Division as a result of intensified monitoring during the Battle of Manila Bay drive, which spilled over in 2020. The Data Encoder, assigned to both ADR and PHC database and in charge of PHC endorsement resigned on March 13, 2020.*

*By usual procedures, the ADR had set the cases for technical conference and issued Certificate of Compliance to complying industries, without much priority on endorsements to PHC to assist them in unclogging cases, given that the massive*

inspections in the Manila and Pasay area resulted to multiple endorsement of water pollution cases that required immediate action like issuance of Cease and Desist Orders, thereby choking more the PHC on such matters.

A mediator who was later hired but was tasked to improve ADR's records management which entailed the preparation of checklist reflecting the contents of the case folders. The ADR dealt with 5,129 cases, both endorsed and pending cases.

To forestall repetitive actions, the ADR conducted requests for re-inspections as case update to assist the PHC which no longer request the same inspection and simply undertake appropriate action. However, the ERD suspended its inspection and saturation activities from 16 March to September 2020 due to pandemic, which affects the ADR requirements prior to endorsement.

Finally, all these initiatives were not fully implemented in view of the erratic work schedule brought about by the pandemic. From March 15, 2020 (midnight) to June 30, 2020, there was a lockdown incapacitating the ADR staff to access to records and database. From July 1, 2020 to December 15, 2020, there was erratic work schedule, which allows limited access to records and database and inconsistent work schedule with the MIS staff. Thus, endorsements were made only during the last quarter of the year, issuance of Certificate of Non-compliance was resumed and request for re-inspections was reiterated for the following year."

Based on the validation of the reported total number of resolved cases issued with COC vis-à-vis submitted endorsement letters and variance on the total was noted, specifically:

AS REPORTED BY LLDA	CGO-A VALIDATED	VARIANCE
300	274	26

Lastly, in LLDA's reported accomplishment, the denominator cover cases from January 2019 to December 2020. However, as previously mentioned, the target of this measure covers unresolved cases as of end December 2019 plus all incoming cases endorsed to ADR in 2020. Thus, the appropriate denominator for this measure should be in accordance with the transmitted recalibrated 2020 Performance Scorecard which is the cumulative unresolved cases as of December 2019 and all incoming cases endorsed to ADR in 2020.

It must be noted that in the 2019 validation, the Governance Commission already raised the inconsistencies noted on the total number of resolved cases with COC and cases endorsed to PHC.

### Appendix 3

#### Validation Result of SM 8: Percentage of PHC Backlog Cases Resolved

LLDA reported to have resolved 625 out of 4,305 backlog cases. The reported accomplishment was substantiated with the copy of the summary of settled/resolved backlog PHC cases and the samples of the corresponding supporting documents of a backlog PHC case. Based on evaluation of the submitted supporting documents, the LLDA was able to resolve 12.41% or 612 cases out of 4,930 backlog cases. Details of the validation are as follows:

Year	AS REPORTED BY LLDA			GCG VALIDATION			VARIANCE ON THE NUMBER OF CASES RESOLVED
	Prior Year Backlog	No. of Cases Resolved for the Current Year	Year-End Balance (Backlog)	No. of Cases Resolved for the Current Year	Year-End Balance (backlog)		
<b>2014</b>	917	131	786	123	794	8	
<b>2015</b>	69	3	66	2	67	1	
<b>2016</b>	524	42	482	41	483	1	
<b>2017</b>	180	14	166	14	166	0	
<b>2018</b>	323	32	291	32	291	0	
<b>2019</b>	2917	403	2514	400	2517	3	
<b>Total</b>	<b>4930</b>	<b>625</b>	<b>4305</b>	<b>612</b>	<b>4318</b>	<b>13</b>	