

TOURISM INFRASTRUCTURE AND ENTERPRISE ZONE AUTHORITY
2016 Performance Scorecard Evaluation

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
	Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
SOCIAL IMPACT	SO 1	Contribute to Country's Competitiveness thru the Development of Sustainable Tourism Zones and Support Infrastructure									
	SM 1	Implementation of the Compliance with the 5-Year Tourism Infrastructure Plan	Milestone/s achieved	15%	All or Nothing	100%	100%	15.00%	100%	15.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tourism Economic Zone (TEZ) Milestones • Excerpts from Minutes of TIEZA Operations Planning conducted in 2015 • Approved Terms of Reference (TOR) on: (1) Children's Playground at the Rizal Park (18 February 2016); and (2) Waterfront Development/ Esplanade and Multipurpose Building (18 November 2016); • Notice to Proceed on the Construction <p>In 2015, TIEZA developed a 5-Year Tourism Infrastructure Program which provides the policy directions and programs in the establishment of a tourism infrastructure program that shall identify vital access roads, airports, seaports, and other infrastructure requirements in identified tourism areas.</p> <p>Based on the supporting documents provided, the TEZ milestones set by TIEZA as 2016 target are as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Redevelopment of Children's Playground - Rizal Park: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Preparation of TOR - 40% b. Presentation of TOR to NPDC - 30% c. Approval of TOR by COO - 30% 2. Waterfront Development/ Esplanade-Rizal Park: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Preparation of TOR - 40% b. Presentation of TOR to NPDC - 30% c. Approval of TOR by COO - 30%

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
	Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
										<p>of TIEZA TEZ Office and San Vicente Tourism Information Center in San Vicente Palawan</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Progress/ Inspection Report on the construction of the TIEZA Office/Tourism Information Center 	<p>3. TIEZA Office/Tourism Information Center - San Vicente:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Notice of Award – 30% b. Notice to Proceed – 30% c. Commencement of Construction – 40% <p>The accomplishments for 2016 are as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Approved TOR on the Redevelopment of Children's Playground in Rizal Park; 2. Approved TOR on the Waterfront Development/ Esplanade in Rizal Park; and, 3. Commenced the construction of the TIEZA Office/Tourism Information Center in San Vicente, Palawan on 21 September 2016. <p>Upon validation, these projects were found to be included as identified strategic projects for the next 5 years under the Strategic Development Plan for Infrastructure Projects which was approved in 2015. TIEZA is given the full rating of 15% considering that it had accomplished the final milestones required per project.</p>

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
	Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
SO 2	Preserve Historical, Cultural, Religious and Heritage Sites and Develop Ecotourism Sites in Depressed Provinces with Strong Tourism Potential										
SM 2	Preservation of Philippine historical, cultural, religious and heritage sites	Number of Philippine Historical, Cultural, Religious and Heritage sites preserved determined by Notice of Award	5%	Actual / Target x Weight	9	0	0.00%	No NOA issued	0.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> List of Board-approved Projects DOT Memorandum on New Projects for Approval (17 May 2016) DOT Order No. 2016-33 (29 Sept. 2016) DOT Memorandum on New Projects for Approval (29 Sept. 2016) 	The request to delete these measures was DENIED . The ratings are hereby MAINTAINED .
SM 3	Assist development in ecotourism sites in depressed provinces	Number of ecotourism sites in depressed provinces with TIEZA infrastructure projects determined by Notice of Awards	5%	Actual / Target x Weight	22	0	0.00%	No NOA issued	0.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Timeline of events and status of various Infrastructure Projects Technical Evaluation Report Title Page and Document Tracking/ Action Page for the Projects 	
	Sub-total		25%				15.00%		15.00%		

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
	Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
FINANCIAL	SO 3	Maximize Absorptive Capacity based on Approved Plans and Programs									
	SM 4	Appropriation Utilization Index - Allocated amount of Board-approved Tourism Infrastructure Projects as per Corporate Operating Budget for the year	Total amount of Board-approved projects for the year / Corporate Operating Budget (Appropriated by the TIEZA Board)	5%	Actual / Target x Weight	100%	100%	5.00%	100%	5.00%	<p>This measure aims to ensure that 100% of the approved budget for tourism infrastructure projects is allocated to specific projects as evidenced by a Board approval.</p> <p>For 2016, the approved budget appropriation for infrastructure outlays amounted to ₱1.26 Billion. Based on the Board Resolutions on project approval, TIEZA was able to allocate 106% of the funds to projects amounting to ₱1.34 Billion. It includes projects approved in 2016 as well as reconfirmed projects from the 2015 program of TIEZA that will be funded under the 2016 budget.</p> <p>It should, however, be noted that a budget utilization rate of more than 100% is not an indication of good performance. TIEZA must establish a financial management system to properly plan, allocate and monitor resources to avoid allocating funds in excess of the approved budget. In this regard, only 100% shall be considered as accomplishment.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Corporate Operating Budget (approved for 2016) • Summary of Infrastructure Projects with Funding Commitments • TIEZA Board Resolutions approving the Projects

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
	Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
SM 5	Allotment Utilization Index - Value of Tourism Infrastructure Projects issued with Notice of Award as per Allocated amount of Board-approved Projects within 1 year period	Amount of projects issued with Notice of Award / Total Allocated Board-approved projects within a 1 year period	5%	Actual / Target x Weight	100%	0	0.00%	-	0.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Timeline of events and status of various Infrastructure Projects Technical Evaluation Report Title Page and Document Tracking/ Action Page for the Projects 	The request to delete this measure was DENIED . The rating is hereby MAINTAINED at 0.00%.
SM 6	Actual funds released over total funds programmed for release as per workplan	Actual released / Programmed (per workplan)	5%	Actual / Target x Weight	100%	94.76%	4.74%	76.75%	3.84%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Summary of Actual Disbursements for Infrastructure Projects 	Based on the submissions, TIEZA reported that it paid a total of ₱258.50 Million or 94.76% of the total project cost of ₱272.80 Million which is computed based on the formula under the scorecard which is "Actual released over Programmed (per workplan)". However, upon validation, it was found that the computation of TIEZA factors in all the payments for the project regardless of the year the actual payment was made, which thus includes prior year payments. As such, a recomputation was made by the GCG to consider only the actual payments released in 2016 over total balance of project cost due for 2016. Result of the

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
	Objective/Measure		Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
												recomputation showed that the total payment for 2016 amounted to ₱142.48 Million while total balance of project cost due for 2016 after deducting payments made during the previous years is ₱185.63 Million. This shows that about 76.75% of the balance due for 2016 was released and disbursed.
SO 4 Achieved Financial Viability and Sustainability of Assets												
	SM 7	Net income from all assets	Actual revenues before subsidies less operating expenditures of operating entities	10%	Actual / Target x Weight	₱120 Million	₱76.63 Million	6.39%	₱ 76.63 Million	6.39%	<ul style="list-style-type: none">Report on the Financial Performance of TIEZA Entities (Target vs. Actual)Summary of Agreements per TIEZA Finance Committee Meeting on 09 August 2016	The request to revise the target was DENIED . The 6.39% rating is hereby MAINTAINED .
	Sub-total			25%				16.13%		15.23%		

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
	Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
CUSTOMERS/ STAKEHOLDERS	SO 5	Institutionalize a TIEZA Brand Anchored on Transparency, Efficiency and Quality for Service and Being Environment Friendly and Filipino-themed for Projects									
	SM 8	Stakeholders Satisfaction Survey for Infrastructure Projects	Engage 3rd Party Consultant for formulation of tool and conduct of survey	5%	Actual / Target x Weight	Satisfactory	Very Satisfactory	5.00%	Very Satisfactory	5.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Customer Satisfaction Survey 2017 Final Report prepared by The All Asian Centre for Enterprise Development (ASCEND), Inc. ASCEND, Inc. letter dated 18 September 2018 <p>The request to reconsider the reported accomplishment was granted. The letter of ASCEND, Inc, the third-party provider of the 2016 survey evaluation of TIEZA, stated that TIEZA received an average satisfaction rating of 91.25% equivalent to an adjectival rating of "Very Satisfactory". With this, TIEZA satisfied and even exceeded the target; hence, the rating for this measure is hereby INCREASED from 0% to 5%.</p>
	SO 6	Develop a Portfolio of Innovative, Customer-Centric Tourism Products and Services									
	SM 9	Number of innovative products and services being developed and offered	Number of innovative products and services being developed and offered	5%	Actual / Target x Weight	2	2	5.00%	2	5.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Report on the Implementation Milestones on AMET Memorandum on User's Training Historical Account of Activities on the Geotagging Project <p>In 2016, TIEZA developed the (1) Automated Monitoring and Evaluation Toolkit (AMET) and (2) Integrated Geotagging Technology for Infrastructure Projects.</p> <p>With this, TIEZA is given 5% for attaining the target to develop 2 innovative products for 2016.</p>

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
	Objective/Measure		Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
	SM 10	Number of deployed online onsite travel tax payment application system	Absolute cumulative number	5%	Actual / Target x Weight	20	16	4.00%	16 out of the revised target of 16 sites	5.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• TIEZA Certifications on the deployment of the Online/On-site Travel Tax Privilege Application and Payment System (OOTPAPS) at the NAIA Terminals 1 and 2• Memorandum of Agreement with Cyware, Incorporated (Consultant), including the Terms of Reference• Letter from Cyware, Inc. on its financial proposal for the project• TIEZA Memorandum on the Justification on the Reduction of Sites from 20 to 16• News item from The	<p>The overall target is to deploy the OOTPAPs in all the 20 sites from 2014 to 2016. As of 2015, it had been deployed to 14 sites, and the remaining 6 sites is targeted for 2016. However, it was deployed by the consultant, the Cyware, Inc., to only 2 sites namely the NAIA Terminals 1 and 2 on 17 August and 6 April 2016, respectively.</p> <p>As such, TIEZA requested to renegotiate to lower the target from 20 to 16. According to TIEZA, the contract with Cyware covered only 16 sites and pursuing the deployment to 4 additional sites would entail high costs since Cyware Inc. still included the development cost of the system for the 4 additional sites. TIEZA maintains that the development cost should no longer be included in the proposal since there is nothing more to develop.</p> <p>Validation of submitted documents showed that the existing MOA with the consultant covers a contract cost that is consistent with the consultant's financial proposal for 16 sites. The Governance Commission acknowledges that the removal of travel tax is being studied by the</p>

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
	Objective/Measure		Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
											Philippine Star dated 25 July 2016 (DOT eyes removal of travel tax)	current administration. As such, entering into another agreement for the installation of additional OOTPAPS must also be revisited to avoid the incurrence of unnecessary costs to the government. In this regard, the request to lower the target to 16 sites is accepted. TIEZA is given the full weight of 5%.
		Sub-total		15%				14.00%		15.00%		
INTERNAL PROCESS	SO 7	Implement Integrated Information System										
	SM 11	Information Systems integrated	Milestones achieved	5%	All or Nothing	Budget Management Monitoring System	100%	5.00%	Development of Budget Management Monitoring System	0.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Certification on the completion of system development of Integrated Budget Management and Monitoring System (iBMMS)• Timeline of Events• Certification of Acceptance dated 14 December 2017• User Acceptance of Deliverable Certificate dated 01	The request for reconsideration was DENIED . With this, the rating for this measure is MAINTAINED at 0.00%.

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
	Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
										December 2016 • Memorandum and Attendance Sheets for Trainings on iBMMs for 2017 • Deployment Summary Report for 2017 • Summary of Activities for 2017 • Development/ Testing/ Implementation Status Report for January and March 2017	
SO 8	Rationalize Development and Management of TEZs and Key TIEZA Assets and Projects										
SM 12	Percent of milestones achieved in the TEZ Flagship Program against the target within the year	Weight of milestones achieved over total weight of target milestones	20%	Actual / Target x Weight	100% of targeted milestones achieved	100%	20.00%	100% of targeted milestones achieved	20.00%	• Matrix of accomplishment on the TEZ Flagship Program • Memorandum to COO on the joint ocular report on inspected sites	For 2016, the target is to attain 100% of the following milestones and sub-milestones: 1. Identification of possible flagship TEZ site (40%): a. Collation – 10% b. Ocular – 30% c. Joint Evaluation – 30% d. Shortlisting – 30% 2. Master Planning (30%):

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
	Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
										<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • TOR on the modular docking facility in San Vicente Flagship TEZ • TOR on the redevelopment of Children's Playground, Rizal Park TEZ • Memorandum to Board of Directors on the designation of Mt. Samat Shrine Flagship TEZ, on Bucas Grande designation and approval of tourism master plan • Front Page of Inception Report on Panglao Bay and Minutes of Meeting on the Discussion thereof 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Preparation of TOR – 30% or 30% b. Award – 35% or 40% c. Inception Report – 35% or 30% <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. One infrastructure in flagship TEZ (30%): <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Preparation of TOR – 40% b. Presentation to TWG – 30% c. COO Approval – 30% <p>Actual accomplishments for 2016 are as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Shortlisted 4 possible TEZ sites out of 6 sites recommended, namely: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Ekran Berhad Property - Samal Casino Hotel, Samal Island; b. Manuel Gallego Estate, Mindoro Oriental; c. Borromeo Property, Camotes Island; and d. Hilantaagan Island. 2. Master Planning: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Submitted a memorandum to TIEZA Board on the designation as Flagship TEZ and approval of Comprehensive Tourism Master Plan of the following: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Mt. Samat Shrine, Bataan; and

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
	Objective/Measure		Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating	
											ii. Bucas Grande (Kapihan Nature and Adventure Park), Surigao del Norte. b. Inception Report on Panglao Bay submitted by Asia Pacific Projects, Inc. which is the third-party consultant that will prepare the Master Plan. 3. One Infrastructure Project in flagship TEZ: a. COO-Approved TORs on: i. Construction/Installation of Modular Docking Facility in San Vicente Flagship TEZ; and ii. Redevelopment of Children's Playground at the Rizal Park Complex Flagship TEZ. TIEZA was able to accomplish 100% of the final milestones required per category, hence the full rating of 20% will be given.
SM 13	Number of Business Development Plans formulated for TIEZA Assets		Man Com approved Business Development Plans	5%	Actual / Target x Weight	2	2	5.00%	2	5.00%	• Memorandum for Management Committee on the approval of Business Development Plans for Cagayan de Oro Convention For 2016, two (2) business plans for TIEZA assets were developed and approved by the Management Committee, namely: (1) Mt. Data Lodge and (2) Cagayan de Oro International Tourism Convention Center (CITCC).

Component						TIEZA Submission		GCG Evaluation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
	Objective/Measure		Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating		
											Center and Mt. Data Lodge <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Business Development Plans for Mt. Data Lodge and Cagayan de Oro International Tourism Convention Center	
		Sub-total		30%				30.00%		25.00%		
LEARNING AND GROWTH	SO 9	Implemented Competency-Based Human Resource System										
	SM 14	Required competencies complied	Milestones achieved	5%	All or Nothing	Establish Baseline on the Competency Level of TIEZA Employees	167	5.00%	Partial Accomplishment (Established Baseline for Employees under SG 18 to 28 and selected SG 15 & 17 employees that occupies supervisory / managerial levels)	0.00%	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Final Report on TIEZA Competency Assessment Project• Justification and Timeline of Events• List of Profiled Employees from 2016 to 2017• Competency Proficiency Assessment Tool	The request to revise the formula and rating scale was DENIED . With this, the rating for this measure is MAINTAINED at 0.00%.
		Sub-total		5%				5.00%		0.00%		
		TOTAL		100%				80.13%		70.23%		