

**LAGUNA LAKE DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY (LLDA)
Validation Result of 2023 Performance Scorecard**

| | | Component | | | LLDA Submission | | GCG Validation | | Supporting Documents | GCG Remarks | | |
|--------------------------------------|-------------|---|---|------------|-----------------|--|---|--------|--------------------------|-------------|---|---|
| Objective/Measure | Formula | Wt. | Rating Scale | Target | Actual | Rating | Actual | Rating | | | | |
| ENVIRONMENTAL / SOCIAL IMPACT | SO 1 | Manage and Improve Water Quality | | | | | | | | | | |
| | SM 1 | Maintain Water Quality | Monthly Values in Milligrams per Liter (mg/L) Biochemical Oxygen Demand (BOD)] / Number of Monitoring Months ¹ | 10% | All or Nothing | Within the Water Quality Guideline for BOD Concentration as per DENR DAO No. 2016-08 | Validation done by LLDA: 2mg/L Validation done by Third Paty Laboratory: 3mg/L | 10% | 2.85 mg/L | 10% | Monthly Reports of Laboratory Analysis of the Environmental Laboratory and Research Division Certificates of Analysis from Third-Party Laboratory (Aeronics Incorporated) | The validated result of 2.85 mg/L was computed using the third-party laboratory results for the months of March, June, September, and December. |
| | SO 2 | Improve Lake Productivity | | | | | | | | | | |
| | SM 2 | Maintain Lake Area Covered by Aquaculture Structures [Net at the End of the Year] | Net Area at the End of the Year (in hectares) | 5% | See Appendix A | 9,200 Hectares | 9,076.72 has. | 5% | 9,103.95 has. | 5% | Revised Profile of Monitored Aquaculture Structures in Laguna De Bay | Target met. |
| | | | | 5% | | 60:40 Distribution Ratio | Corporations (Fish Pens): 4,349.08 has. Cooperatives and Individuals (Fish Cages): 4,727.64 has. | 3.25% | 52:48 Distribution Ratio | 3.25% | Revised Summary Report of Fish Pens and Fish Cages Assessment Forms and Technical Evaluation Forms of Randomly Selected Accounts | The rating was computed based on the average rating of 4,776.92 hectares for cooperatives (5%) and 4,327.03 hectares for corporations (1.5%). |
| | | Sub-total | | 20% | | | 18.25% | | 18.25% | | | |

¹ Monitoring or water quality test should cover all the 15 sampling stations and conducted per month.

Validation Result of the 2023 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

| | Component | | | | LLDA Submission | | GCG Validation | | Supporting Documents | GCG Remarks | | |
|--------------|-------------------|------------------------------------|--|--------------|--|------------------|------------------------------------|--------|----------------------|-------------|---|---|
| | Objective/Measure | Formula | Wt. | Rating Scale | Target | Actual | Rating | Actual | | | Rating | |
| STAKEHOLDERS | SO 3 | Improve Stakeholders' Satisfaction | | | | | | | | | | |
| | SM 3 | Percentage of Satisfied Customers | Total Number of Respondents Who Gave a Rating of At Least Satisfactory / Total Number of Respondents | 10% | (Actual / Target) x Weight <i>If Less Than 80% = 0%</i> | 90% | CSS Report Preparation is On-going | - | 98% | 10% | Harmonized Client Satisfaction Measurement Results of GOCCs Covered by R.A. No. 10149 as endorsed by the Anti-Red Tape Authority (ARTA) | The result is based on the responses of clients availing external services only. The CSM score refers to the percentage of respondents who rated 'Agree' and 'Strongly Agree' for <i>Service Quality Dimension 0: "I am satisfied with the service that I availed"</i> . |
| | | Sub-total | | 10% | | | | - | | 10% | | |
| FINANCIAL | SO 4 | Increase Revenues | | | | | | | | | | |
| | SM 4 | Revenue Generation | Sales / Revenue from Operations + Other Revenues | 10% | (Actual / Target) x Weight | ₱456.745 Million | ₱495.079 Million | 10% | ₱469.646 Million | 10% | COA Annual Audit Report | Target exceeded. |
| | SM 5a | Obligation Budget Utilization Rate | Total Obligations / DBM-Approved Corporate Operating Budget (Both Net of PS Cost) | 5% | (Actual / Target) x Weight | 90% | 51.45% | 2.57% | 48.99% | 2.72% | 2023 DBM-approved Corporate Operating Budget (COB) 2023 Reconciled Budget Utilization Report of LLDA | The validated accomplishment was computed based on the total obligations amounting to ₱121,384,646.51 and COB of ₱247,758,000, both net of PS Cost. |

Validation Result of the 2023 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

| | | Component | | | | LLDA Submission | | GCG Validation | | Supporting Documents | GCG Remarks | |
|-------------------|---|---|---|----------------------------|----------------------------|-----------------|--------|----------------|---------------|--|---|---|
| Objective/Measure | | Formula | Wt. | Rating Scale | Target | Actual | Rating | Actual | Rating | | | |
| INTERNAL PROCESS | SM 5b | Disbursement Budget Utilization Rate | Total Disbursements / Total Obligations (Both Net of PS Cost) | 5% | (Actual / Target) x Weight | 90% | 86.24% | 4% | 74.79% | 4.16% | (excluding AWQMF) 2023 COA Annual Audit Report Schedule of Accounts generated from the electronic National Government Accounting System (eNGAS) | The validated accomplishment was computed based on the total disbursements equal to ₱90,779,895.00 and total obligations amounting to ₱121,384,646.51, both net of PS Cost. |
| | SM 5c | Disbursement Budget Utilization Rate | Total Disbursements / DBM-Approved Corporate Operating Budget (Both Net of PS Cost) | 5% | (Actual / Target) x Weight | 90% | 44.37% | 2.22% | 36.64% | 2.04% | General Ledger of Area Water Quality Management Funds (AWQMF) General Ledger pertaining to Budget Utilization Timeline of Events Detailing the Non-utilization of the Subsidy | The validated accomplishment was computed based on the total disbursements equal to ₱90,779,895.00 and COB of ₱247,758,000.00 both net of PS Cost. |
| | Sub-total | | | | 25% | | | | 19.58% | | 18.92% | |
| SO 5 | | Implement Streamlined Regulatory Processes | | | | | | | | | | |
| SM 6 | Percentage of Applications for Permits and Licenses Processed Within the Applicable | Total Number of Permits and Licenses Issued Within Applicable Processing Time ² / Total Number of Applications | 5% | (Actual / Target) x Weight | 100% | 98.05% | 4.90% | 92.13% | 4.61% | 2023 Citizen's Charter Revised Masterlist of Permits and Licenses Copies of Assessment Forms, Discharge Permits, | LLDA processed 7,629 out of 8,281 applications within the prescribed turnaround time. | |

² Applicable processing time of permits and licenses based on the of LLDA's compliance with Republic Act No. 11032 and LLDA's Citizen's Charter.

Validation Result of the 2023 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

| Component | | | | | LLDA Submission | | GCG Validation | | Supporting Documents | GCG Remarks |
|-------------------|---|--|--------------|----------------------------|-----------------|--------|----------------|---------------------|--|--|
| Objective/Measure | Formula | Wt. | Rating Scale | Target | Actual | Rating | Actual | Rating | | |
| | Processing Time | for Permits and Licenses Received | | | | | | | Certificates of Exemption, and LLDA Clearances of Randomly Selected Transactions | |
| SO 6 | Strengthen Existing Quasi-Judicial Functions | | | | | | | | | |
| SM 7 | Percentage of Cases Resolved Through Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) | Total Number of Cases Resolved through ADR / Total Number of Unresolved Cases as of End of Preceding Year + New Cases for Current Year | 10% | (Actual / Target) x Weight | 65% | 49.65% | 7.64% | Cannot be Validated | 0% | <p>The Governance Commission noted discrepancies in the processing of ADR cases, i.e. 50 randomly selected cases did not have the corresponding CNC despite LLDA's confirmation during the onsite validation that all Endorsement Letters to PHC should have a corresponding CNC.</p> <p>Inconsistencies were also noted in the database submitted.</p> <p>Pursuant to Section 9 of GCG M.C. No. 2023-01, "measures for which the GOCC fails to submit the requested validating documents within the prescribed deadline, and for accomplishments that cannot be objectively verified by GCG on account of inadequate or incomplete documentation shall be given an automatic zero score."</p> |

Validation Result of the 2023 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

| Objective/Measure | | Component | | | | LLDA Submission | | GCG Validation | | Supporting Documents | GCG Remarks |
|-------------------|---|--|-----|----------------------------|---|-----------------|--------|------------------|--------|--|--|
| | | Formula | Wt. | Rating Scale | Target | Actual | Rating | Actual | Rating | | |
| SM 8 | Percentage of Cases Resolved Through Public Hearing Committee (PHC) Within Applicable Processing Time | Total Number of PHC Cases Resolved Within Applicable Processing Time / Total Number of Cases Endorsed to PHC from July 1 of the Previous Year to June 30 of the Preceding Year | - | All or Nothing | Establish Baseline Based on the Applicable Processing Time approved by ARTA | Attained | 5% | Measure excluded | | Chronology of Events LLDA Letters to ARTA Minutes of the Meeting between ARTA and LLDA | The issue on whether the 3-7-20 rule applies to the quasi-judicial function of LLDA was only clarified during a meeting between LLDA and ARTA on 23 November 2023. Considering that there is no basis for the prescribed processing time yet, this measure is excluded in the 2023 Performance Scorecard of LLDA. |
| SM 9 | Percentage of PHC Backlog Cases Resolved | Total Number of Backlog Cases Resolved through PHC / Total Number of Backlog Cases | 10% | (Actual / Target) x Weight | 20% | 21.26% | 10% | 20.53% | 10% | Revised Percentage of PHC Backlog Cases Resolved Summary of PHC Backlog Cases Resolved per Year 2023 PHC Unresolved Cases Copies of the Decisions | The validated accomplishment corresponds to 1,350 resolved cases out of 6,576 backlog cases. |

Validation Result of the 2023 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

| Objective/Measure | | Component | | | LLDA Submission | | GCG Validation | | Supporting Documents | GCG Remarks | |
|-------------------|--|--|------------|----------------------------|---|--|----------------|--|----------------------|---|---|
| | | Formula | Wt. | Rating Scale | Target | Actual | Rating | Actual | | | Rating |
| SO 7 | | Implement Effective Quality Management System | | | | | | | | | |
| SM 10 | Maintain ISO Certification | Actual Accomplishment | 5% | All or Nothing | ISO 9001:2015 Recertification | ISO 9001:2015 Recertification issued on 21 December 2023 | 5% | ISO 9001:2015 Certification Maintained | 5% | ISO Certification Attestation Certificate Audit Report | The surveillance audit was conducted on 09 October 2023. LLDA's ISO 9001:2015 Certificate has a scope "Public Administration covering Environmental Regulation Department, Resource Management and Development Department, Board of Directors, Office of the General Manager, and Management Services Department." |
| SO 8 | | Develop and Enhance Automated Processes | | | | | | | | | |
| SM 11 | Implementation of the Information System Strategic Plan (ISSP) | Total Number of Deliverables Due for 2023 Attained / Total Number of Deliverables Due for 2023 | 5% | (Actual / Target) x Weight | 100% Attainment of 2023 Deliverables Under the ISSP | (Only the status of each deliverable was provided) | 2.5% | 0% | 0% | 2023-2025 ISSP approved by DICT Justification for the Non-accomplishment of the 2023 Deliverables | Target not met. |
| Sub-total | | | 35% | | | | 35.04% | | 19.61% | | |

Validation Result of the 2023 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

| | | Component | | | | LLDA Submission | | GCG Validation | | Supporting Documents | GCG Remarks | |
|---------------------|---------|---|--|------------------|----------------|---|--|----------------|--|----------------------|---|--|
| Objective/Measure | Formula | Wt. | Rating Scale | Target | Actual | Rating | Actual | Rating | | | | |
| LEARNING AND GROWTH | SO 9 | Maintain a Motivated and Committed Workforce | | | | | | | | | | |
| | SM 12 | Percentage of Employees Meeting Required Competencies | Competency Baseline ⁵ 2023 – Competency Baseline 2022 | 5% | All or Nothing | Improve the Competency Baseline of the Organization | 1.39% Improvement in the Competency Baseline of LLDA Employees from 83.30% in 2022 to 84.69% in 2023 | 5% | 1.39% Improvement in the Competency Baseline | 5% | Competency Assessment Report Samples of Accomplished Competency Assessment Forms | The competency baseline increased from 83.30% in 2022 to 84.69% in 2023. |
| | | | Sub-total | 5% | | | | 5% | | 5% | | |
| | | | TOTAL EXCLUDED WEIGHT | 100% (5%) | | | | 77.08% | | 71.78% | | |
| | | | VALIDATED TOTAL | 95% | | | | - | 71.78/95 = 75.56% | | | |

⁵ The competency baseline of the organization shall pertain to the average percentage of required competencies met which can be computed using the following formula:

$$\frac{\sum_{b=1}^B \left[\frac{\sum_{a=1}^A (\text{Actual Competency Level})}{A} \right]}{B}$$

where: a = Competency required, A = Total number of competencies required of position, b = Personnel profiled, B = Total number of personnel profiled

TARGET AND CORRESPONDING RATING SYSTEM FOR SM 2

| SM 2: MAINTAIN LAKE AREA COVERED BY AQUACULTURE STRUCTURES [NET AT THE END OF THE YEAR] | |
|---|---|
| RATING SYSTEM | TARGET |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Within the target = 10% rating b. Exceedance of up to 10% in total area = 7% rating c. Exceedance of up to 11% to 20% in total area = 5% rating d. Exceedance of more than 20% in total area = 0% rating | 9,200 hectares |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. <u>Within the target allocations:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Corporation: $\leq 3,680$ hectares (has.) = 2.5% 2. Cooperatives and individuals: $\leq 5,520$ has. = 2.5% b. <u>Exceedance of up to 10% in total allocations:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Corporation: $> 3,680$ has. but $< 4,048$ has. = 1.5% 2. Cooperatives and individuals: $> 5,520$ has. but $< 6,072$ has. = 1.5% c. <u>Exceedance of 10% to 20% in total allocations:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Corporation: $> 4,048$ has. but $< 4,416$ has. = 1% 2. Cooperatives and individuals: $> 6,072$ has. but $< 6,624$ has. = 1% d. <u>Exceedance of more than 20% in total allocations:</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Corporation: $> 4,416$ has. = 0% 2. Cooperatives and individuals: $> 6,624$ has. = 0% | <p>60:40 distribution ratio</p> <p>Out of the 9,200 hectares, 60% shall be allocated for individual ownership and cooperatives or (5,520 has.) while the remaining 40% shall be for private corporations (or 3,680 has.).</p> |