

**NATIONAL FOOD AUTHORITY (NFA)
Revalidation Result of the 2019 Performance Scorecard**

	Objective/Measure	Component				NFA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
		Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
SOCIAL IMPACT	SO 1	Ensure Food Security									
	SM 1	Guarantee Procurement of Rice and/or Palay	Actual rice and/or palay procured / NFA Council-approved procurement	20%	All or Nothing	100%	188% (731,745MT)	20%	Cannot be validated	0%	Disbursement Vouchers Abstracts of Grains Purchases Warehouse Stock Receipts Purchase Receipts

¹ Based on 15 April 2020 submission. Officially received by the Governance Commission on 28 April 2020.

Validation Result of 2019 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Objective/Measure	Component		Rating Scale	Target	NFA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
	Formula	Weight			Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
										<i>Details of the observations are presented in Appendix 1.</i>	
		<i>Sub-total</i>	20%				20%		0%		
SO 2	Availability, Accessibility, Affordability and Food Safety										
STAKEHOLDERS	SM 2	Average Farmgate Price in Surplus Provinces	Average Farmgate Price (₱/kg) for the year	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight If less than ₱15.30/kg = 0%	₱17.00/kg	₱17.55/kg	10%	₱16.60/kg	9.76%	<p>Provincial and Regional Report on the Average Farmgate Price of Palay</p> <p>Farm, Wholesale and Retail Prices of Palay, Rice and Corn Report</p> <p>PSA Computation of Surplus/Deficit Provinces PSA Website Data</p> <p>Validated figure is based on the updated list of surplus provinces.</p> <p>The GCG observed that the surplus provinces used by NFA in their computation were based on 2013 data. Upon comparison with the PSA database, it was noted that the NFA list is outdated and requires updating. Following the PSA-provided guidelines on the computation of surplus provinces, the GCG determined the updated list Appendix 2.</p>
	SM 3	Stocks Maintained in Safe & Consumable Condition	% Total Stocks in Safe & Consumable Condition / Total Stocks Stored	10%	99% – 100% = 10% 98% – 98.99% = 7% 97% – 97.99% = 5% 96% – 96.99% = 3% < 96% = 0	100%	99.99%	10%	Cannot be validated	0%	<p>National Quality Assessment Report (QUASAR)</p> <p>National Consolidated Report per Commodity per Stock Quality</p> <p>Percentage Performance Rating of Stocks per Region</p> <p><i>Request for reconsideration DENIED.</i></p> <p><i>The discrepancies observed for samples on bad stocks – January, April, and June – were rectified.</i></p> <p><i>The justification presented for sample on bad stock (October) and total stocks (Region XI) remains unacceptable since the same cannot be</i></p>

Validation Result of 2019 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Objective/Measure		Component		NFA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks		
		Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating			Actual	Rating
									<p>National Consolidated Report of Consumable Stocks per Region per Commodity</p> <p>Summary of Commodity per Region per Quality for Good and Consumable Stocks</p> <p>Consolidated Report on Non-Consumable (Sweepings and Damaged) Stocks per Cereal Type per Region</p> <p>Summary of Non-Consumable (Sweepings and Damaged)</p> <p>Volume of Assessed Stocks per Region per Commodity per Age (Good, Treated & Infested)</p> <p>Monthly Grains Stock Quality Report</p>	<p><i>objectively validated by the Governance Commission.</i></p> <p><i>No request for reconsideration for the Region XI (October) sample.</i></p> <p><i>Details of the observations are presented in Appendix 3.</i></p>	
SO 3 Sustain Client Satisfaction											
SM 4	Percentage of Satisfied Customers	Number of Respondents who gave a Rating of at least Satisfactory / Total Number of Respondents	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight If below 80% = 0%	90%	Customer Satisfaction Survey Result is Very Satisfactory (VS)	10%	97%	10%	<p>2019 NFA Customer Satisfaction Survey Report</p> <p>Sample Accomplished Survey Forms</p>	<p><i>Request for reconsideration GRANTED.</i></p> <p><i>The survey covered 500 farmer respondents. The CSS was conducted on 18</i></p>

Validation Result of 2019 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Objective/Measure		Component				NFA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
		Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
										Database on Spot-Checking and Back-Checking	November to 20 December 2019 through intercept interview.	
		<i>Sub-total</i>	30%				30%		19.76%			
SO 4 Divestment of Non-Performing Assets												
FINANCIAL	SM 5	Divestment of Assets Approved for Disposition by the NFA Council	Actual Accomplishment	15%	Divestment or Disposal of the Asset = 15% Conduct of Bidding or Public Auction = 7.5%	Divestment of one (1) NFA Property	NDO Property Sold in 2019	15%	One (1) Property sold to the Philippine National Railways (PNR)	15%	Divestment Plan 2017-2021 Divestment Plan 2019-2023 Minutes of the Regular Council Meetings NFA Council Resolution No. 952-2020-A Original Deed of Sale Amended Deed of Absolute Sale Board Approval of PNR's acquisition of the NFA-NDO Property	Target met.

Validation Result of 2019 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

		Component				NFA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
SO 5	Improve Debt Management										
SM 6	Managed Debt Level (Bank Loans)	Debt Level Equal to or Lower than the Projected Level by End of a Given Year	15%	₱120 Billion and below = 10% ₱121 Billion to ₱130 Billion = 5% Above ₱130 Billion = 0%	₱120 Billion	₱99 Billion	15%	₱99.830 Billion	15%	2019 COA Annual Audit Report	Target exceeded.
<i>Sub-total</i>		30%				30%		30%			
SO 6	Establish Quality Management System (QMS)										
SM 7	Implement Quality Management System	Actual Accomplishment	10%	Recertification /Passing of Surveillance Audit for FDC, Tarlac Provincial Office, TRSD and Iloilo City Regional Office; and ISO 9001:2015 Certification for NCR-CDO, Region III (Cabanatuan City), Bicol Regional Office and Albay Provincial Office = 10%	ISO 9001:2015 Certification for NCR-CDO, Region III (Cabanatuan City), Bicol Regional Office and Albay Provincial Office; And Recertification/Passing of Surveillance Audit for FDC, Tarlac Provincial Office, TRSD and Iloilo	-	-	-	-	DBM letter dated 31 October 2019	Measure excluded. The DBM, through its letter dated 31 October 2019 granted NFA's request to suspend its compliance to the QMS requirement of Executive Order No. 605 ² for the year 2019. The approval of Republic Act No. 11203 ³ on 14 February 2019 revoked the regulatory, licensing, and importation functions of the NFA starting 05 March 2019. Per the DBM, the ongoing restructuring, functional, and organizational modifications of the agency may result in NFA's failure to effectively implement key activities of

² Institutionalizing the Structure, Mechanisms and Standards to implement the Government Quality Management Program, Amending for the Purpose Administrative Order No. 161, s. 2006

³ An Act Liberalizing the Importation, Exportation and Trading of Rice, Lifting for the Purpose the Quantitative Import Restriction on Tice, and for Other Purposes

Validation Result of 2019 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Objective/Measure		Component			NFA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
		Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual			Rating
				Recertification /Passing of Surveillance Audit for FDC, Tarlac Provincial Office, TRSD and Iloilo City Regional Office = 5%	City Regional Office					its documented QMS that could constitute as a ground for suspension, cancellation, or withdrawal of its existing ISO 9001:2015 QMS certifications.	
SO 7 Establish Competency Framework											
SM 8	Percentage of Employees Meeting Required Competencies	Number of positions with competency baseline established / Total number of positions	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight If below 50% = 0%	Establish Competency Baseline Covering 100% of Positions	Established Competency Baseline covering 100% of positions	10%	83.31%	8.33% (3,079 / 3,696)	Competency Baseline Assessment Competency Manual 2019 Workforce Complement Data Report on the 2019 NFA Competency Framework and Target Competency Assessment Results	Validated actual performance below target. Verification of submitted documents showed that only 3,079 employees were provided with competency assessment instead of the reported 3,619 employees. Based on the 2019 COA Annual Audit Report, the NFA has a total of 3,963 filled positions, as of 31 December 2019, out of the total 4,703 authorized regular plantilla positions. The total number of employees used in computing the accomplishment of this measure (3,696 filled positions) excluded 267 co-terminus positions which were not included in the development of competency framework due to the nature of their

2

Validation Result of 2019 Performance Scorecard (*Annex A*)

Objective/Measure			Component		NFA Submission ¹		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
			Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating		
										positions (i.e. for abolition once vacated).
<i>Sub-total</i>			20%				10%		8.33%	
			100%				90%		<u>58.09% out of 90%</u> <u>64.54% out of 100%</u>	

Strategic Measure 1: Stocks Maintained in Good and Consumable Condition

Region	Province	Month	NFA-reported	GCG-validated	Variance	Remarks
I	Ilocos Sur	October	47,359	54,471	(7,112)	Did not tally; Validated data is number of bags converted from the Estimated Net Weight (ENW); Five (5) accounts did not include ENW but only indicated the amount in the disbursement voucher (DV)
II	Isabela	June	50,704	51,055	(351)	Did not tally (based on DVs)
				50,242	(50,242)	Did not tally (based on Abstracts of Grains Purchases)
III	Nueva Ecija	December	95,360	89,063	6,297	Did not tally (only Abstract of Grains Purchases were submitted)
IV	Batangas	December	11,505	10,967	538	Did not tally
	Laguna		3,750	3,693	57	Did not tally
	Oriental Mindoro		60,908	61,084	(176)	Did not tally; insufficient supporting documents (only Abstract of Grains Purchases were submitted)
	Quezon		6,792	6,792	-	Acceptable
V	Camarines Sur	August	4,975	-	-	Cannot be validated; No supporting documents submitted
VI	Antique	July	290	325	(35)	Did not tally; insufficient supporting documents (only Abstract of Grains Purchases were submitted)
VII	Bohol	April	593	652	(59)	Did not tally
	Negros Oriental		120	120	-	Acceptable
VIII	Biliran	January	38	-	-	Cannot be validated; Supporting documents insufficient/cannot be verified (only Abstract of Grains Purchases were submitted, cannot establish if one of the submissions is for January)
IX	Zamboanga del Norte	November	22,142	20,542	1,600	Did not tally; insufficient supporting documents (only Abstract of Grains Purchases were provided); Conversion to bags based on net kilograms
				20,068	2,074	Did not tally; insufficient supporting documents (only Abstract of Grains Purchases were provided); Conversion to bags based on ENW
X	Lanao del Norte	March	2,466	2,467	(1)	Minor discrepancy; Conversion to bags based on ENW
				2,110	356	Did not tally; Based on the number of bags reported in DV and Abstract of Grains Purchases
XI	Davao del Sur	May	8,625	4,270	4,355	Did not tally; Insufficient supporting documents (DVs did not indicate the total number of bags to support the Abstract of Grains Purchases submitted)

Region	Province	Month	NFA-reported	GCG-validated	Variance	Remarks
XII	Sultan Kudarat	February	9,859	9,859	(0)	Data matched using number of bags converted from net kilogram
				9,237	622	Did not tally using number of bags converted from ENW
CARAGA	Agusan del Sur	June	14,671	3,453	11,218	Did not tally; Number of bags converted from net kilograms
				3,273	11,398	Did not tally; Number of bags converted from ENW
BARMM	Maguindanao	September	4,537	3,117	1,420	Did not tally; Insufficient supporting documents (only Abstract of Grains Purchases were submitted)
NCR/ Suburbs	Cavite	March	277	451	(174)	Validated number of bags based on the Abstract of Grains Purchases
				274	3	Validated number of bags based on the DVs

R

Strategic Measure 2: Average Farmgate Price in Surplus Provinces

	Surplus Provinces ¹	Farmgate Prices (Annual) ²
1	Abra	18.07
2	Apayao	14.29
3	Ifugao	17.46
4	Kalinga	16.34
5	Ilocos Norte	17.46
6	Ilocos Sur	17.12
7	Pangasinan	17.26
8	Cagayan	14.78
9	Isabela	16.54
10	Nueva Vizcaya	16.39
11	Quirino	15.56
12	Aurora	15.08
13	Nueva Ecija	13.77
14	Tarlac	15.40
15	Occidental Mindoro	18.13
16	Oriental Mindoro	17.24
17	Palawan	16.84
18	Camarines Sur	14.71
19	Antique	16.57
20	Capiz	16.76
21	Guimaras	17.98
22	Iloilo	16.62
23	Biliran	17.96
24	Leyte	18.07
25	Zamboanga del Norte	17.65
26	Zamboanga del Sur	18.43
27	Zamboanga Sibugay	17.77
28	Bukidnon	18.09
29	Cotabato	15.80
30	Sultan Kudarat	15.16
31	Agusan del Sur	15.27
32	Maguindanao	16.54
	Average	16.60

¹ Surplus or deficit provinces is the difference between rice production and total usage of rice. Rice production is palay production multiplied by general milling recovery rate of 65%. Data on palay production was sourced from the PSA website (https://openstat.psa.gov.ph/PXWeb/pxweb/en/DB/DB_2E_CS/0012E4VC/P0.px/?rxid=bf9d8da-96f1-4100-ae0918cb3eae0918cb3e). Total usage of rice is the sum of food use, seeds, and wastage/feeds. Food use is computed by multiplying per capita consumption on rice and population. The latest data on the per capita consumption on rice is 2017 and thus for the purpose of computation of the 2019 surplus/deficit provinces, it was assumed that the per capita consumption on rice is constant. Data on per capita consumption on rice was sourced from the PSA website (<https://psa.gov.ph/content/consumption-selected-agricultural-commodities-philippines-volume-1-february-2017-0>) while population data for 2019 is based on the PSA projections based on 2015 population census (<https://psa.gov.ph/content/updated-population-projections-based-results-2015-popcen>). Seeds is computed by dividing the product of area harvested for palay for the year by default values of 76.55/hectare and 65% by 1000. Data on the area harvested for palay was sourced from the PSA website (https://openstat.psa.gov.ph/PXWeb/pxweb/en/DB/DB_2E_CS/0022E4AHC0.px/?rxid=bf9d8da-96f1-4100-ae0918cb3eae0918cb3e). Wastage/feeds is the product of rice production multiplied by 9.5%.

² Farmgate prices was sourced from the PSA website (https://openstat.psa.gov.ph/PXWeb/pxweb/en/DB/DB_2M_FG/0032M4AFP01.px/?rxid=eacb22d5-d79d-431b-840f-7d0d284e5a92).

Strategic Measure 3: Stocks Maintained in Good and Consumable Condition

Sampling on Total Stocks Stored

Month	Region Sampled for the Month	GCG Evaluation				NFA Report		Discrepancy	Remarks
		No.	Provincial Reports	Sub-total (in kilos)	Total (in 50kg bags)	Regional Data Report (in 50 KG Bags)			
January	Region IX	1	Zamboanga del Norte	769,000.00	450,867.50	450,867.40	0.10	Discrepancy is negligible.	
		2	Zamboanga del Sur	969,066.42					
		3	Zamboanga Sibugay	960,068.51					
		4	Zamboanga City	19,845,239.86					
February	Region I	1	Abra	1,688,750.00	1,041,300.00	1,041,300.00	-	Acceptable.	
		2	Benguet	1,524,450.00					
		3	Ilocos Norte	3,040,900.00					
		4	Ilocos Sur	2,792,800.00					
		5	La Union	30,611,450.00					
		6	East Pangasinan	4,463,250.00					
		7	West Pangasinan	7,943,400.00					
March	Region II	1	Santiago	7,835,818.00	1,034,706.41	1,034,706.20	0.21	Discrepancy is negligible.	
		2	Cagayan	7,871,205.00					
		3	Kalinga	3,524,742.15					
		4	Isabela	19,030,150.00					
		5	Quirino	3,394,696.80					
		6	Nueva Vizcaya	7,958,002.40					
		7	Ifugao	1,647,850.00					
		8	Mountain Province	472,856.20					
April	Region III	1	Aurora	3,674,584.41	2,396,743.08	2,395,782.30	960.78	During the meeting, the NFA was able to reconcile the inconsistencies for Region III. NFA noted that the lacking 960	

Month	Region Sampled for the Month	GCG Evaluation				NFA Report	Discrepancy	Remarks
		No.	Provincial Reports	Sub-total (in kilos)	Total (in 50kg bags)	Regional Data Report (in 50 KG Bags)		
		2	Bataan	7,967,910.22				bags were from the report of the Aurora Province, stating that the 48,022 kilos (equivalent to 960.44 bags) of palay from Aurora were not recorded into the final amount for the region. After the adjustment, the discrepancy becomes negligible.
		3	Bulacan	28,775,305.23				
		4	Nueva Ecija	35,394,554.69				
		5	Pampanga	16,768,930.09				
		6	Tarlac	18,871,360.61				
		7	Zambales	8,384,508.96				
		May	Region IV-A and IV-B	1				
2	Infanta			1,534,975.78				
3	Laguna			3,452,437.00				
4	Quezon			8,252,255.78				
5	Mamburao			16,942,546.44				
6	Marinduque			1,293,799.00				
7	Occidental Mindoro			51,072,652.38				
8	Oriental Mindoro			4,662,270.21				
9	Palawan			2,735,737.39				
10	Romblon			120,219.76				

Month	Region Sampled for the Month	GCG Evaluation				NFA Report	Discrepancy	Remarks
		No.	Provincial Reports	Sub-total (in kilos)	Total (in 50kg bags)	Regional Data Report (in 50 KG Bags)		
June	Region V	1	Albay	6,322,582.55	520,724.26	520,724.00	0.26	Discrepancy is negligible.
		2	Camarines Norte	3,065,104.70				
		3	Camarines Sur	11,784,050.00				
		4	Catanduanes	855,944.97				
		5	Masbate	881,730.70				
		6	Sorsogon	3,126,800.00				
July	Region VI	1	Aklan	800,286.00	324,399.86	324,399.90	(0.04)	Discrepancy is negligible.
		2	Antique	2,643,036.00				
		3	Capiz	2,981,517.00				
		4	Iloilo Province	7,172,554.00				
		5	Negros Occidental Province	2,622,600.00				
August	Region VII	1	Bohol	899,200.00	54,683.05	54,682.90	0.15	Discrepancy is negligible.
		2	Cebu P.O.	603,826.57				
		3	Negros Oriental	1,115,575.85				
		4	Siquijor	115,550.00				
September	Region VIII	1	Leyte	1,779,450.00	91,864.62	91,864.60	0.02	Discrepancy is negligible.
		2	Biliran	393,041.00				
		3	SO. Leyte	790,640.00				
		4	Samar	461,700.00				
		5	N. Samar	670,700.00				
		6	E. Samar	497,700.00				
October	Region XI	1	Davao Oriental	2,689,200.00	449,722.00	449,714.40	7.60	<u>No request for reconsideration.</u>
		2	General Santos/Sarangani	2,718,350.00				
		3	Davao del Sur	7,167,250.00				
		4	Davao City	4,479,900.00				
		5	Davao del Norte	3,655,550.00				

Month	Region Sampled for the Month	GCG Evaluation				NFA Report	Discrepancy	Remarks
		No.	Provincial Reports	Sub-total (in kilos)	Total (in 50kg bags)	Regional Data Report (in 50 KG Bags)		
		6	Compostela Valley	1,775,850.00				
November	Region XII	1	Sultan Kudarat	25,916,988.00	1,145,084.44	1,045,563.30	99,521.14	Request for reconsideration <i>DENIED.</i> NFA explained that the differences in the amount was "a result of human error in encoding the regional data in our internal computerized reporting system." NFA provided the recalculation to balance out the provincial and regional reports. However, the Governance Commission cannot objectively validate the basis of the new figures presented.
		2	South Cotabato	5,771,456.00				
		3	North Cotabato	25,565,778.00				
December	Region XIII / Caraga Administrative Region	1	Agusan del Norte	2,910,250.00	283,214.61	283,214.40	0.21	Discrepancy is negligible.
		2	Agusan del Sur	8,818,330.34				
		3	Surigao del Norte	301,050.00				
		4	Surigao del Sur	2,131,100.00				

Sampling on Bad Stocks

NCR Quality Assessment (Bad Stocks)				
Month	NFA Report	GCG Evaluation using the Provincial Assessment Reports	Discrepancy	Remarks
	Regional Data Report (in 50 kg bags)	Actual (in 50 kg bags)		
January	228.50	284.59	56.09	<u>Request for reconsideration GRANTED.</u> <u>NFA was able to explain/justify the discrepancy in the reported amounts.</u> <u>The discrepancy was due to the non-inclusion of 40 bags from South District Office and 16 bags from East District Office.</u>
February	284.60	284.59	(0.01)	Acceptable
March	284.60	284.59	(0.01)	Acceptable
April	244.60	284.59	39.99	<u>Request for reconsideration GRANTED.</u> <u>NFA was able to explain/justify the discrepancy in the reported amounts.</u> <u>The discrepancy was due to the non-inclusion of 40 bags from South District Office.</u>
May	284.60	284.59	(0.01)	Acceptable
June	244.60	-	(244.60)	<u>Request for reconsideration GRANTED.</u> <u>During the initial validation, supporting documents submitted were insufficient.</u> <u>Additional supporting documents submitted for the request for reconsideration was able to rectify the discrepancy of 244.60 bags.</u>
July	-	-	-	No bad stocks recorded.
August	83.30	83.30	-	Acceptable
September	88.40	88.43	0.03	Acceptable
October	445.30	441.28	(4.02)	Request for reconsideration <u>DENIED.</u>

NCR Quality Assessment (Bad Stocks)				
Month	NFA Report	GCG Evaluation using the Provincial Assessment Reports	Discrepancy	Remarks
	Regional Data Report (in 50 kg bags)	Actual (in 50 kg bags)		
				<p>NFA explained that the differences in the amount was due to wrong encoding.</p> <p>NFA provided the recalculation to balance out the provincial and regional reports. However, the Governance Commission cannot objectively validate the basis of the new figures presented.</p>
November	690.30	690.39	0.09	Acceptable
December	753.30	753.38	0.08	Acceptable

2