

LAGUNA LAKE DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY
Revalidated Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard

Component		Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks			
Objective / Measure	Formula		Wt.	2018	Actual	Rating	Score			Rating		
ENVIRONMENTAL / SOCIAL IMPACT	SO 1	Manage and Improve Water Quality (Class C)										
	SM 1	Maintain Water Quality of Laguna de Bay	Monthly values [in milligrams per liter (mg/L) Biochemical Oxygen Demand (BOD)] / 12 months	10%	All or nothing	Within the standard BOD level as prescribed by the DENR ¹	Annual average value of 2 mg/L	10%	Annual average value of 2 mg/L is within the standard BOD level	10%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summary of BOD results per station • Result of Laboratory Analysis (ROLA) Forms • Raw Data Forms 	Acceptable
	SM 2	Percentage of Establishments Disposing Wastewater Within Standard Biochemical Oxygen Demand (BOD) ²	Total number of establishments disposing wastewater within standard BOD / Total number of establishments under the Control List	7.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	90% of the Control List	347 of 407 industries disposing wastewater within the standard of 50 mg/L for BOD compliant	7.10%	85.26% (347 of 407 industries disposing wastewater within the standard of 50 mg/L for BOD compliant)	7.10%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summary of inspected industries under the Control List • ROLA Forms 	Acceptable.

¹ Water Quality Guidelines and General Effluent Standards (DENR A.O. No. 2016-08) provides that the required minimum BOD for Class C water bodies is 7 mg/L.

² Water Quality Guidelines and General Effluent Standards (DENR A.O. No. 2016-08) provides that the maximum BOD for New/Proposed Industry or wastewater treatment plants to be constructed under Class C inland water category is 50 mg/L.

Revalidated Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks		
Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.		2018	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating				
	SO 2	Improve Lake Productivity										
	SM 3	Maintain Lake Area Covered by Aquaculture Structures [Net at the End of the Year]	Net area at the end of the year [in hectares (has.)]	7.5%	All or Nothing	9,200 has.	Reduced structures are classified as follows: Illegal, Self-reduction, Abandoned, not existing and non-operational; Total Fishpen and Fishcage Area = 7,647.39 has.	7.50%	7,397 has.	7.50%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Status of fishpen / fishcage area reduction as of 2018 Inventory of operational, demolished, and not existing aquastructures Profile of fishcages summary 	Validated accomplishment based on the revised report to incorporate clean ups conducted in 2017 and 2018.
	Sub-total			25%				24.6%		24.6%		
STAKEHOLDERS	SO 3	Improve Stakeholder Satisfaction										
	SM 4	Percentage of Satisfied Customers	Total number of respondents which gave at least Satisfactory rating / Total number of respondents	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight 0% = If less than 80%	90%	88% of the respondents rated LLDA at least Satisfactory rating	9.78%	88% of the respondents gave a rating of at least Satisfactory rating	9.78%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2018 Customer Satisfaction Survey Final Report Transmittal letter from DAP dated 25 March 2019 Sample survey questionnaires 	Acceptable.

Revalidated Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

	Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
	Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.		2018	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
	SO 4	Ensure Environmental / Regulatory Compliance										
	SM 5	Percentage of Settled / Resolved Notice of Violations (NOVs)	Cumulative number of NOVs settled or resolved as of year-end ³ / Cumulative number of cases issued with NOVs as of year-end (through ADR or PHC)	10%	All or Nothing	Establish baseline	Baseline data established; 4,122 of NOVs settled/resolved as of 2018 out of 9,249 cases issued with NOV as of 2018 (through ADR or PHC)	10%	Measure excluded.	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Summary of the Baseline data List of Pending Cases Copy of Resolutions or Dismissal of cases 	Request for reconsideration is DENIED. LLDA already represented during the Technical Panel Meetings for its 2019 and 2020 PES that this measure is already captured in SMs 7 and 8. Hence, the recognition of the effort of the organization in the resolution of cases is properly captured and given due merit under the said measures.
	Sub-total			20%				19.78%		9.78%		
	SO 5	Increase Revenues										
FINANCIAL	SM 6	Revenue Generation	Sales/ Revenue from Operations + Other Revenue	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	P275.07 Million	P249,053,532 ⁴	7.55%	P211.36 Million	7.68%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> COA Audited Report Financial Statements with Accompanying Notes 	Request to restore the effect of the reclassified Area Water Quality Management Fund (AWQMF) to the actual revenue is DENIED. However, since the same was not foreseen during the target

³ Settled or resolved shall include cases where establishment is issued with LLDA Clearance or Permit being able to comply with the all the requirements of LLDA.

⁴ The foregoing amount includes P37,691,926.00, representing the variable fees collected due to implementation of Environmental Users Fee System (EUFs). The COA, in its 2017 Annual Audit Report recommended Management to set-up separate funds similar to Area Water Quality Management Funds (AWQMF), sourced from wastewater discharge fees such as the EUFs (2017 COA AAR).

Revalidated Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component			Rating Scale	Target 2018	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks		
Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.			Actual	Rating	Score	Rating				
Sub-total			10%			7.55%		7.68%		setting, the effect of the AWQMF on the target will be removed to make the evaluation fairly comparable. In this regard, the target was REVISED from ₱330 Million to ₱275.07 Million.		
INTERNAL PROCESS	SO 6	Improve Efficiency in Quasi-Judicial Functions										
	SM 7	Percentage of Cases Resolved Through Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR)	Total number of NOV's resolved through ADR/ Total number of NOV's endorsed to ADR	7.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	5 percentage points increase from preceding year's actual	<u>63.07% cases resolved with Certificate of Compliance (345 out of 547 cases)</u>	7.50%	<u>10.82% (307 NOV's issued with Certificate of Compliance out of 2,838 cases)</u> ⁵	7.5%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>List of Resolved Cases Through ADR</u> • <u>Copy of Commitment Sheets</u> • <u>Copy of Certificate of Compliances</u> • <u>Copy of memoranda on the endorsement of cases to PHC</u> 	<u>Request for reconsideration is APPROVED. In 2017, LLDA was able to dispose 55 cases out of 2,346 (858 new cases for the year + 1,488 unresolved cases by end of 2016) or disposition rate of 2.34%.</u>
	SM 8	Percentage of Cases Resolved Through Public Hearing Committee (PHC) Within	Total number of PHC cases resolved within applicable processing	7.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	90%	Water pollution: <u>79</u> out of 206 cases resolved within 120wd; refusal of entry: <u>4</u> out of	2.75%	33.03% (110/333) Water pollution: <u>79</u> out of 206 cases	2.75%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • List of Resolved Cases Through PHC • Copy of Resolutions or Dismissal of cases 	Acceptable.

⁵ See Appendix A for the table summary of GCG's validation.

Revalidated Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.			2018	Actual	Rating	Score		
	Applicable Processing Time ⁶	time / Total number of cases endorsed to PHC from July 1 of the previous year to June 30 of the current year			15 cases resolved within 95wd; operating w/o DP: 17 out of 64 cases resolved within 170wd operating w/o LC: 10 out of 48 cases resolved within 120wd		resolved within 120wd; refusal of entry: 4 out of 15 cases resolved within 95wd; operating w/o DP: 17 out of 64 cases resolved within 170wd operating w/o LC: 10 out of 48 cases resolved within 120wd			
SM 9	Percentage of PHC Backlog Cases Resolved	Total number of backlog cases resolved / Total <u>number of backlog cases before June 30 of preceding year</u>	7.5%	50%	68.75% of PHC backlog cases resolved from 1995 to June 2017 (6,722 out of 9,850)	7.50%	14.15% (1,394 out of 9,850)	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Summary of settled / resolved backlog PHC cases Copy of sampled PHC backlog cases Certification from LLDA-PHC Chairman that documents were not found in its offices Letter from Office of the President to LLDA dated 20 	<u>LLDA's request for reconsideration that only cases from 2014 should be included in the denominator is DENIED. As provided in the GCG-transmitted 2018 Performance Scorecard, the measure shall include all pending or unresolved cases under the PHC as of June 30, 2017. The provision of cut-off period is to provide due</u>

⁶ Applicable processing time for case resolution: Operating without LLDA Clearance – 120 working days (wd), Operating without Discharge Permit – 170 wd, Refusal of Entry – 95 wd, Water Pollution – 120 wd, Violation of ZOMAP – 60 wd. For purposes of computation, the processing time would begin from date case is endorsed to ADR for resolution and ends on the issuance of appropriate order (Order to Pay, Cease and Desist Order, or Order of Dismissal).

Revalidated Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.		2018	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
									May 2013 re authorization to dispose valueless records	<u>time to LLDA to dispose backlog cases. To clarify, it is not the intention of this Commission to limit this measure to backlog cases starting 2014 only, considering that a number of cases from 1995 up to 2013 were not yet resolved by LLDA.</u>	
SO 7 Streamline Regulatory Processes											
SM 10	Percentage of Applications for Permits and Licenses Processed Within Applicable Processing Time ⁷	Total number of permits and licenses acted upon within applicable processing time / Total number of applications for permits and licenses received	7.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	70%	1,383 permits and clearances issued within applicable processing time out of 5,934 applications received	2.50%	23.31% (1,383 permits and clearances issued within applicable processing time out of 5,934 applications received)	2.50%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Summary of Permits and Licenses Processed During the Year Copy of Permits and Licenses Copy of Reply Letters issued to Applicants 	Acceptable. The formula was revised to also capture the requests that were returned by LLDA to applicants sans action due to incomplete requirements or other legal concerns.
Sub-total			30%				20.25%		12.75%		

⁷ Applicable processing time for permits and licenses: LLDA Clearance – 20 days, LLDA Clearance Exemption – 10 days, New Discharge Permit – 30 wd, Renewal of Discharge Permit – 15 wd, Revalidation of Discharge Permit – 1 wd, Accreditation of Pollution Control Officers – 3 days, Barging Clearance (new and renewal) – 5 days after inspection, and Survey Services – 3 days.

	Component			Rating Scale	Target 2018	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
	Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.			Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
LEARNING AND GROWTH	SO 8 Maintain Motivated and Committed Workforce											
	SM 11	Percentage of Required Competencies Met	Total number of employees meeting the required competencies / Total number of employees	5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	Reduce Competency Gap of the Organization by 25%	2018 Competency Assessment: Gap Analysis	5%	Reduced Competency Gap of the Organization by 27%	5%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2018 Competency Assessment: Gap Analysis dated December 2018 Sample Survey Questionnaires Competency Assessment Sheets per Position 	<p>Formula revised to present total number of employees meeting required competencies to be consistent with the reported accomplishment in 2016 and 2018.</p> <p>In 2016, there were only 20 out of 140 employees or 14% meeting the required competencies for their positions. In 2018, 60 out of 164 employees or 37% met the required competencies, lowering the percentage of employees with gap, from 86% in 2016 to 63% in 2018.</p>
	SO 9 Automate Processes											
	SM 12	Processes for Automation	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Operational Online Payment System, including cashiering system	none	0%	none	0%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Board Resolution No. 554, series of 2018 authorizing the General Manager to confer upon Cloud Panda Inc. dated 29 November 2018 	No reported accomplishment.

Revalidated Result of 2018 Performance Scorecard (Annex A)

Component			Rating Scale	Target	Submission		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective / Measure	Formula	Wt.		2018	Actual	Rating	Score	Rating			
SO 10	Develop and Implement Quality Management System (QMS)										
SM 13	Attain ISO Certification	Actual accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	Certification under ISO 9001:2015 Standards	Copy of the ISO Certification	5%	Certification under ISO 9001:2015 Standards	5%	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Registration Certificate AJA15-0051 issued by AJA to LLDA (date of re-registration 13 Nov 2018) Registration Schedule AJA15-0051 (date of re-registration 13 Nov 2018) AJA Registrars Audit Report 	Acceptable.
		Sub-total	15%				10%		10%		
		TOTAL	100%				82.18%		64.81% out of 90%		
		VALIDATED RATING					82.18%		72.01%		