

**LAGUNA LAKE DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY (LLDA)
Revalidation Result of 2021 Performance Scorecard**

		Component			LLDA Submission*		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
ENVIRONMENTAL / SOCIAL IMPACT	SO 1	Manage and Improve Water Quality (Class C)									
	SM 1	Maintain Water Quality of Laguna de Bay	Monthly Values [in milligrams per liter (mg/L) Biochemical Oxygen (BOD)] / Number of Monitoring Months ¹	15%	All or Nothing	Within the Water Quality Guideline for BOD Concentration as per DENR DAO 2016-08 (7 mg/L)	2 mg/L	15%	2.99 mg/L	15%	<p>Monthly Reports of Laboratory Analysis</p> <p>Certificates of Analysis from Aeronics Incorporated</p> <p>Memorandum from the Executive Secretary dated 27 March 2021 on the "Imposition of Enhanced Community Quarantine (ECQ) in Bulacan, Cavite, Laguna, Rizal, and the National Capital Region"</p> <p>Internal Memorandum from the Resource Management and Development</p>

* Based on the submission of the LLDA through a letter dated 24 February 2022. Officially received by the Governance Commission on 01 March 2022.

¹ Monitoring or water quality test should cover all the 15 sampling stations and conducted per month.

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

Component					LLDA Submission ²		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
									Department dated 15 September 2021	
SO 2	Improve Lake Productivity									
SM 2	Maintain Lake Area Covered by Aquaculture Structures [Net at the End of the Year]	Net Area at the End of the Year [in hectares (has.)]	10%	See Appendix A	9,200 has.	7,606 has.	10%	<u>Cannot Be Validated</u>	0%	<p><u>Revised Summary List of Aquaculture Structures in Laguna de Bay Assessment Forms for Fish Pen/Fish Cage Permit for 2022</u></p> <p><u>Technical Evaluation Forms for Fish Pen/Fish Cage Registration for 2022</u></p> <p>The measure was requested for revalidation. Based on the sampling conducted, the Governance Commission noted instances of double counting in the summary report for fish pens with ownership transfer and a discrepancy in the reported area under the summary report as cross-checked against the corresponding Assessment Form and Technical Evaluation Form. The foregoing findings casted doubt on the veracity of the submitted revised Summary Report. Foregoing considered, the zero rating initially awarded to the measure is retained.</p>
			5%	See Appendix A	60:40 Distribution Ratio ²	Corporations = 4,433.24 Cooperatives and Individuals = 3,173.36	2.50%	<u>Cannot Be Validated</u>	0%	
	Sub-total		30%			27.50%		15%		

² Out of the 9,200 hectares, 60% shall be allocated for individual ownership (or 5,520 has.) while the remaining 40% shall be for private corporations (or 3,680 has.).

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

		Component				LLDA Submission*		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating				
STAKEHOLDERS	SO 3	Improve Stakeholders Satisfaction										
	SM 3	Percentage of Satisfied Customers	Total Number of Respondents which Gave At Least Satisfactory Rating / Total Number of Respondents	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight 0% = If Less Than 80%	90%	-	-	81.71%	9.08%	Final Report on the Customer Satisfaction Survey of LLDA Raw Data	Target not met.
		Sub-total		10%				-		9.08%		
FINANCIAL	SO 4	Increase Revenues										
	SM 4	Revenue Generation	Sales / Revenue from Operations + Other Revenue	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	₱389.26 Million	₱374,491,498	9.62%	₱374,709,498	9.63%	COA Annual Audit Report	Target not met.
		Sub-total		10%				9.62%		9.63%		
INTERNAL PROCESS	SO 5	Streamline Regulatory Processes										
	SM 5	Percentage of Applications for Permits and Licenses Processed Within Applicable Processing Time ³	Total Number of Permits and Licenses Issued Within Applicable Processing Time / Total Number of Applications for Permits and Licenses Received	7.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	100%	96.21% (6,396 Permits and Clearances Issued Within Applicable Processing Time Out of 6,648 Applications Received)	7.22%	98.08% (6,015 Permits and Clearances Issued Within Applicable Processing Time Out of 6,133 Applications Received)	7.36%	Citizen's Charter Masterlist of Licenses and Permits Copies of the Assessment Forms, Discharge Permits, Certificates of Exemption, and	Target not met. It should be noted that the Governance Commission limited the universe to the approved transactions.

³ The processes to be covered and the applicable processing time shall be based on the Citizen's Charter of LLDA in accordance with Republic Act No. 11032, otherwise known as the Ease of Doing Business and Efficient Government Service Delivery Act of 2018. Stop and start times shall be adopted in the computation of the actual turnaround time. Stop time is to be considered when the necessary action/step is pending on the part of the applicant.

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

Component					LLDA Submission*		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
									LLDA Clearances		
SO 6	Improve Efficiency in Quasi-Judicial Functions										
SM 6	Percentage of Cases Resolved Through Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR)	Total Number of Cases Resolved through ADR / Total Number of Unresolved Cases as of End of Preceding Year + New Cases for Current Year ⁴	10%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	65% ⁵	1,316 Resolved Cases through ADR Out of 2,758 Unresolved Cases as of December 2021	7.34%	<u>Cannot Be Validated</u>	0%	<p><u>Revised Summary Report of Cases Resolved through ADR and Monthly ADR Reports</u></p> <p><u>Certificates of Compliance and Public Hearing Committee (PHC) Endorsements</u></p> <p><u>Summary of Unresolved Cases for 2020 and 2021</u></p> <p><u>Docketing of Cases for Cases in September 2020 and August 2021</u></p>	<p><u>The measure was requested for revalidation.</u></p> <p><u>The Governance Commission could not objectively validate the total number of unresolved cases. It was noted that there were cases with Endorsement to Legal and Adjudication Division that were not in the summary list. Likewise, there were cases that were part of the summary list without the corresponding Endorsement to the Legal and Adjudication Division.</u></p> <p><u>The discrepancies noted casted doubt on the validity and accuracy of the submitted supporting documents. As such, the Governance Commission could not confirm and objectively verify the reported accomplishment of the LLDA.</u></p>
SM 7	Percentage of Cases	<u>Excluded from the 2021 Performance Scorecard</u>							<u>Letters and E-mails between</u>	<u>The measure was requested for revalidation.</u>	

⁴ For purposes of 2021 target, the denominator shall pertain to unresolved cases as of end December 2020 plus all incoming cases endorsed to ADR in 2021.

⁵ Based on the reported accomplishment for 2019 request for revalidation.

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

Objective/Measure	Component				LLDA Submission*		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
Resolved Through Public Hearing Committee (PHC) within Applicable Processing Time ⁶									<p><u>the LLDA and the Anti-Red Tape Authority (ARTA)</u></p> <p><u>Minutes of the Meeting with the ARTA</u></p>	<p><u>Review of the submitted documents showed that through a meeting of the LLDA with the ARTA on 31 May 2022, the ARTA informed the LLDA that the prescribed 3, 7, or 20 working days rule for turnaround time shall not apply to the quasi-judicial functions of the corporation. Following the meeting of the LLDA with ARTA, the LLDA submitted the process flow and flowchart with processing time to the ARTA for review and approval. Despite the follow up of the LLDA, the ARTA has yet to approve the timelines for the quasi-judicial functions of the LLDA, which includes the PHC.</u></p> <p><u>Considering that the request of the LLDA on the turnaround time for the PHC is still under review of the ARTA, the Governance Commission excluded the measure in the 2021 Performance Scorecard of the corporation.</u></p>

⁶ Applicable processing time shall be in compliance with Republic Act No. 11032 or otherwise known as the Ease of Doing Business and Efficient Government Service Act of 2018. Stop and start time shall be adopted in the computation of actual turnaround time. Stop time is to be considered when the necessary action/step is pending with other parties.

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

Component					LLDA Submission*		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks	
Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating			
SM 8	Percentage of PHC Backlog Cases ⁸ Resolved	Total Number of Backlog Cases Resolved through PHC / Total Number of Backlog Cases	7.5%	(Actual / Target) x Weight	25%	9.17% (From 1995 to December 2020: 548 Out of 5,974 Backlog Cases Resolved)	2.75%	Cannot Be Validated	0%	<p><u>The measure was requested for revalidation.</u></p> <p><u>The Governance Commission could not objectively validate the total number of backlog cases. Upon comparing the validated yearend balance as of 2019 with the LLDA reported prior year balance, the Governance Commission observed a significant discrepancy in the total number of backlog cases. A summary of the sampled years is provided in Appendix B.</u></p> <p><u>Foregoing considered, the zero rating awarded to the measure is retained.</u></p>	
Sub-total			35%				24.79%		7.36%		
SO 7	Develop and Implement Quality Management System (QMS)										
SM 9	Attain ISO Certification	Actual Accomplishment	5%	All or Nothing	ISO 9001:2015 Recertification	LLDA Attained the ISO 9001:2015 Recertification for the Year 2021	5%	Maintenance of ISO 9001:2015 Certificate	5%	Attestation from Third-Party Certifying Body Audit Report	Target met.

⁸ Backlog cases pertains to unresolved cases under the PHC by end of the previous year. For purposes of 2021 target, backlog cases pertain to cases under the PHC by end of December 2020.

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

	Component				LLDA Submission*		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks		
	Objective/Measure	Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual			Rating	
LEARNING AND GROWTH	SO 8	Maintain Motivated and Committed Workforce										
	SM 10	Percentage of Employees Meeting Required Competencies	Actual Accomplishment ⁹	5%	All or Nothing	Improve Competency Baseline of the Organization	1.34% Improvement in the Competency Baseline of LLDA Employees from 80.34% in 2020 to 81.77% in 2021	5%	1.34% Improvement in the Competency Baseline	5%	Competency Assessment Report Memorandum on the Competency Survey Sample Competency Surveys Excel Files on the Individual and Organizational Competency Matrix	Target met.
	SM 11	Processes for Automation	Actual Accomplishment	5%	Roll-Out of Online Aquaculture Management System or Roll-Out of Online Payment	Roll-Out of the Following: (1) Online Aquaculture Management System and (2) Online Payment Portal	Online Aquaculture Management System – Issued User-Acceptance and Ready for Roll-out Online Payment Portal – Payment	4.50%	Online Aquaculture Management System Rolled-Out in 2021	2.5%	User Acceptance Tests Screenshots of the Systems	Target not met. The Governance Commission noted that the Online Payment Portal was rolled out on 17 March 2022, which is not within the performance year being evaluated.

⁹ The competency baseline of the organization shall pertain to the average percentage of required competencies met which can be computed using the following formula:

$$\frac{\sum_{a=1}^A \left(\frac{\text{Actual Competency Level}_a}{\text{Required Competency Level}_a} \right)}{B}$$

where: a = Competency required, A = Total number of competencies required of position, b = Personnel profiled, B = Total number of personnel profiled

Handwritten signature

Validation Result of the 2021 Performance Scorecard of LLDA (Annex A)

Objective/Measure		Component				LLDA Submission*		GCG Validation		Supporting Documents	GCG Remarks
		Formula	Weight	Rating Scale	Target	Actual	Rating	Actual	Rating		
				Portal = 2.5%							
				Roll-Out of Online Aquaculture Management System and Roll-Out of Online Payment Portal = 5%			Portal Facility is Available on the Cloud Panda Platform; Additional Payment from Bayad Center				
		Sub-total			10%				14.50%		12.50%
		TOTAL			90%				76.41%		53.57% out of 90% 59.52% out of 100%